



Transit Advisory Board  
Thursday, July 11, 2019  
Alvarado Transit Center – 2<sup>nd</sup> Floor  
100 1<sup>st</sup> St. SW  
Albuquerque, NM 87102

**Members Present**

Brendan Miller, Chair; (drove & walked); Israel Chavez, (car); Rachel Hertzman, (Uber); Orville Pratt, (bus); William Moore, (walked); Kimberly Andujo, (walked); Harris Balkin, (walked); Patrician Salisbury (bus); Steve Pilon, (bike & bus);

**Members Absent - Excused**

Kathy Foster; Christopher Ramirez

**Staff Members Present**

Rita Chavez, Executive Assistant; (car)

**Visitors Present**

Peter Rice, Downtown Albuquerque News (bike); Alan Stacy, (Sun Van)

**Call to Order**

Brendan Miller, Chair called the meeting to order at 4:02pm.

**Approval of Agenda**

Brendan Miller, Chair, asked for a Motion to approve the July 11, 2019 agenda with the Community Involvement RFP process topic tabled until next meeting. Israel Chavez made a motion to accept the agenda as amended. Harris Balkin, 2<sup>nd</sup> the Motion. Motion approved unanimously, 8-0 by Transit Advisory Board (TAB) Members.

**Approval of Minutes**

Brendan Miller, Chair asked for a Motion to approve the June 13, 2019 minutes as presented. Rachel Hertzman requested that the spelling of her last name be corrected. Harris Balkin made a motion to accept the June 13, 2019 minutes as presented with amendments. Israel Chavez, 2<sup>nd</sup> the motion. Motion approved unanimously, 8-0 by Transit Advisory Board (TAB) Members.

**Public Comment** – Reminder there is a 2 minute limit on Public Comment

No Public Comments

**Elections and Resolutions**

Brendan Miller presented the 2020 Resolutions for approval. Israel Chavez, made a motion to approve the Resolutions as presented. Rachel Hertzman, 2<sup>nd</sup> the motion. Motion approved unanimously, 8-0 by Transit Advisory Board (TAB) Members.

Brendan Miller, opened the floor for officer nominations. Brendan Miller nominated Israel Chavez, TAB member to serve as Chairperson. Israel Chavez accepted the nomination to serve as Chair.

Israel Chavez, TAB member nominated Brendan Miller, Chairperson to serve as Vice Chair. Brendan Miller, Chairperson accepted the nomination to serve as Vice Chair.

## **Elections and Resolutions (Cont.)**

Kimberly Andujo, TAB Member nominated herself for Vice Chair for TAB.

Israel Chavez made a motion to close nominations. William Moore 2<sup>nd</sup> the motion. Motion approved unanimously, 8-0 by Transit Advisory Board (TAB) Members.

Brendan Miller made a motion to accept the nomination of Israel Chavez to serve as Chairperson of the Transit Advisory Board (TAB). Motion approved unanimously, 8-0 by Transit Advisory Board (TAB) Members.

The TAB members requested that the vote of Vice Chairperson be by secret ballot. Israel Chavez, Chair entertained a motion to vote for Vice Chairperson by secret ballot. William Moore made a motion to hold secret ballot election. Orville Pratt, 2<sup>nd</sup> the motion. Motion approved unanimously, 8-0 by Transit Advisory Board (TAB) Members.

### **Each candidate was given 2 minutes to introduce themselves and state why they would like to be Vice Chairperson for the Transit Advisory Board (TAB).**

Brendan Miller - Brendan has served as Chairperson for the TAB for the past two years, he would like to continue to serve on the TAB and Brendan would love the opportunity to serve with Israel Chavez. Brendan is very passionate about Transit and achieving equity transportation for all.

Kimberly Andujo - Serves as a volunteer through AmeriCorps Vista with the Mayor's office. In her current position she is in the process of meeting with all the volunteer coordinators for the City programs. Kimberly would like to take an active role by serving on the TAB, she has many ideas and will work to make good changes for everyone. She wants the TAB to know she doesn't know a lot about Robert's Rules and the flow of the meeting but she is eager to learn.

All TAB members in attendance were given a blank ballot to write in the name of the candidate they wished to select for Vice Chairperson. After the vote was completed Rita Chavez, Executive Assistant collected all the ballots and read aloud the vote. There were 5 votes for Kimberly Andujo and 4 votes for Brendan Miller. Kimberly Andujo, was declared Vice-Chairperson.

### **Public Comment** – Reminder there is a 2 minute limit on Public Comment

Alan Stacy stated he wanted to attend a meeting to observe and listen to see what this Board is all about. A friend of Mr. Stacy, Lucy Birbiglia recommended he attend a meeting.

### **Chairperson Report, Brendan Miller** **No Report**

### **Israel Chavez, Chair Elect Report**

Israel wanted to share his vision for the upcoming term. A reminder that the TAB is not a policy making board or an appropriating board so the Board does not have money or any "real" authority. But the benefit for serving on the TAB is to have direct conversations with transit staff and the executive branch within the City. Israel had a conversation with the Mayor recently and asked him to attend a TAB meeting. The Mayor would like to attend a meeting in the fall when his schedule allows.

Israel is looking into how the TAB can better serve outside their meetings, such as holding Transit Town Halls where the public can share their experiences on public transit and how the TAB can be a leaders to the public with transit issues. The TAB will work with City Council on Transit issues and challenges to get legislation passed. He would like to begin to set goals on what the board would like to work on this term.

### **Israel Chavez, Chair Elect (Cont).**

Kimberly Andjuo, Vice Chair, feels it would be a perfect opportunity to engage with non-profits or organizations to volunteer for Adopt-a-Stop. There are 2,894 bus stops in the City and only (27) twenty-seven have been adopted. This is a great opportunity for the TAB members and other community organizations to show their support for transit by adopting a stop. An example would be when Together 4 Brothers attended a TAB meeting advocating for “free” bus passes. The organization can adopt-a-stop and a possible benefit would be receiving “free” bus passes. It is something to discuss within the board and would demonstrate that TAB members support the Transit department.

Israel would also like to discuss the possibility of having sub-committees within the Board. It would allow the Board to focus on the expertise of members. For example, Brendan and Patricia have great knowledge with bus routes and stops, Kimberly with Adopt-a-Stop and volunteers. This would give the Board more opportunities to focus on these types of issues.

### **Director’s Report, Bernie Toon**

The Director and the Deputy Director had other engagements and were unable to attend this meeting.

### **Rita Chavez, Executive Assistant gave the ridership report**

In June our Fixed Route Ridership was 729,045 versus 791,047 during June of 2018, a decline month over month of **-7.84%** versus last year. Most of the decline was in weekday ridership, with Saturday down slightly and Sunday ridership increased over FY18. June 2018 had 5 Saturdays, June 2019 had 5 Saturdays and 5 Sundays. That may account for the Sunday ridership increase.

For all of FY19 our Fixed Route Ridership was 9,159,709 a decline of **-5.17%** from FY18’s 9,659,486. This is the lowest ridership since FY 2006. Only in July and August did ridership increase during FY19.

### **Questions to Transit Department from TAB members**

#### **Israel Chavez, TAB Member**

*Israel along with the TAB members would like to know how the cost for free bus passes for APS was calculated. He would like to compare the numbers with UNM and CNM’s MOU.*

In answer to the question by the TAB members as to how the approximately \$500,000 dollar amount was arrived at for students, I want to present the context of the question in which the approximately \$500,000 was provided to City Council. City Council posed this question as part of Physical Goal questions for the FY20 budget in April 2019. Here is the question and answer.

The Transit Department has not considered reducing or eliminating fares for students. To do so, the Department would need to find a replacement for the estimated \$485,000 in revenue from student fares and establish a system for validating which passengers are actually students. Eliminating these fares could also jeopardize the Department’s current agreements with UNM and CNM for them to pay for their students, faculty and staff to ride without fares. Those agreements are \$90,000 and \$100,000, respectively. Student fares are already about 60 – 65% below full fare (35 cents vs \$1.00 adult fare), reducing but not eliminating those fares would likely not result in significant added value for students. Eliminating student fares entirely may encourage higher ridership but could also lead to more fare disputes with riders claiming to be students but lacking identification to prove their eligibility. If a significant amount of City funding is available to replace lost fares, this revenue could be used to improve services and potentially yield equal or greater benefits for everyone.

### Questions to Transit Department from TAB members(Cont.)

The \$485,000 figure was based upon the budgeted figure for student passes. After further research into this issue, we have discovered that the \$485,000 was an overstatement. It was based upon an antiquated allocation model that was prepared to allocate daily fare box revenue to student boarding's. We receive fare (cash/coin) revenue each day from the fare boxes on the buses. Rather than adjusting revenue daily based upon actuals, an allocation model was developed years ago based upon annual ridership and it was determined in the past that 23% of daily fare activity was attributed to student boarding's.

We are now working on updating this allocation. What we know is that over the last 12 months,

- 239,482 students boarded a bus and paid \$0.35 cents for a one-way ride.
- 240,844 students boarded a bus and used a pre-paid monthly bus pass.
  - o 710 monthly bus passes were donated in FY19 to APS, therefore a small portion of the above figure represents a zero dollar fare
  - o What we don't know is how many times a student used a monthly bus pass each month (we are estimating once a day for 20 days)
- Based upon this figures is an estimate of \$163,000 in revenue

Therefore, our estimate now is that Transit receives \$163,000 in revenue from student passes, but we do not know how many of these students attend APS schools.

Also, keep in mind that any changes to fares would need to be approved by City Council via a change to the fare ordinance and prior to that a fare equity analysis would need to be prepared in support of Federal Title VI requirements in order to evaluate the effects of fare changes on both minority populations and low-income populations.

(see also: [https://www.transit.dot.gov/sites/fta.dot.gov/files/docs/Title\\_VI\\_Fare\\_Equity\\_10.25.12\\_BG.pdf](https://www.transit.dot.gov/sites/fta.dot.gov/files/docs/Title_VI_Fare_Equity_10.25.12_BG.pdf)).

This response came from Chris Payton, Transit Fiscal Manager

### June 13, 2019-TAB Meeting Questions/Replies

#### **Steve Pilon, TAB Member**

*Steve made a request that he would like to see the numbers regarding the "free" rides for special events/days with regard to the drop in revenue. (Earth day)*

#### **Annette Paez, Transit Deputy Director**

Annette stated that the information will be provided to the group by the next TAB meeting. **(A survey Hand-out was provided on Earth Day to TAB Members-On File with Transit)**

**The reason there was information on the Earth Day event was due to the fact a survey was created for riders. Typically there is no ridership data on "free" rides for special events as it would be difficult to capture that information. There is information on the following events because there is a charge: Freedom 4<sup>th</sup> and the Luminaria Tour. There is typically data for special events when a fee is charged i.e. Balloon Fiesta and State Fair.**

#### **Rachel Hertzman and Christopher Ramirez, TAB Members**

*Rachel asked if it would be possible for the ridership data to include a column with monthly regular ridership of just the individuals who pay daily to ride the bus. Also, With regard to the ridership report can TAB see data on the routes, specifically which routes are being used most often and which ones are not being use?*

#### **Annette Paez, Transit Deputy Director**

Annette will check and see if we can add this information to the ridership report.

*It was determined, at this time Transit is unable to add this information to the report. This would be difficult to complete due to staffing issues and the amount of work that is involved in gathering information for the paid daily riders. There is a report that is completed monthly on the following:*

*Number of Veteran Riders*

*Number of Bicycles Riders*

*Number of Wheelchair Riders*

*The reason for this report is that it is easy to track and the Mayor and City Councilors ask for these reports on a monthly basis.*

*There is not a monthly report on the data for which routes are being used most often or least often. There is a yearly report that is completed in February or March that does provide data on the routes most/least used. We do have that report for your review for the 2018 year. (On-file in Transit Department-hand-out provided at meeting.)*

### **Unfinished Business**

FTA Funding Agreement Decision -The Transit Department has initiated an amendment with the FTA and the Small Start Grant Agreement (SSGA) asking the FTA if transit can keep the money in lieu of returning the difference between the \$7,000,000 which is the cost difference of the electric buses. The FTA allowed the Transit Department to keep about \$7.5 million in funding.

Community Involvement in RFP Process with Transit - This topic of discussion has been tabled to the next TAB meeting on August 8, 2019.

### **New Business**

Fixed Route Service – TAB Member, Steve Pilon has several questions and ideas regarding fixed bus routes. After a brief discussion it was decided that TAB members should contact the TAB Chairperson to be placed on the agenda to provide a presentation regarding concerns and ideas. The TAB members feel that if they work together as a group with specific items/ideas it would be more effective. The TAB members were also reminded the Transit Department will be reviewing and addressing the fixed route service issues during the Study. Mr. Pilon is hoping to look at improving service for the fixed route bus service before the Transit Study.

### **Israel Chavez, Chairperson**

The more formalized a specific approach with suggestions or concerns is taken, the more seriously and effective it can be when relating information to TAB members, Transit or City Administration i.e. formal presentation, formal letter or attending a City Council meeting etc.

### **Old Business**

None

### **Public Comment** – Reminder there is a 2 minute limit on Public Comment

Mr. Alan Stacy: He has very positive experiences with Sun Van. He rides Sun Van because the nearest bus stop is over a mile away from him.

### **Announcements**

No announcements

### **Adjournment**

The TAB meeting was adjourned at 5:23pm by Israel Chavez, Chair.

**Next Meeting: Thursday, August 8, 2019; 4:00 PM at the ATC-2<sup>nd</sup> Floor**