

**Moderators:**

Lilly Irvin-Vitela New Mexico First; Melanie Sanchez Eastwood, New Mexico First; Sharon Berman, New Mexico First; Erika Robers, New Mexico First; Wendy Wintermute, New Mexico First

**CABQ Staff:**

Kelsey Rader, Environmental Health Department; Alice Main, Environmental Health Department; Natalie Duncan, Environmental Health Department; Chris Chavez, Economic Development Department; Jill Holbert, Solid Waste Department; Terra Reed, Planning Department; Stephanie Dominguez, ABQ Ride; Andrew De Garmo, ABQ Ride

**Task Force Members:**

Genesis Arizmendi; Kevin Bean; Molly Blumhoefer; Sharon Hausam; Cassandra Miller; Alex Montano; Chas Robles; Tony Sparks; Tara Trafton; Erica Velarde

**Community Registrants:** Claudia Borchert; Carol Boss; Bill Bright; Athena Christodoulou; Susan Gorman; Anni Hanna; Elaine Hebard; Patrick Jaramillo; Munene Kasina; Kali Levsen; Jeanne Logsdon; Lora Lucero; Kateri Sava; Fiana Shapiro; Jeff Sims; Ralph Wrons

Agenda
<b>5:30 PM – 5:35 PM Introduction &amp; Event Road Map</b> Lilly Irvin-Vitela & Kelsey Rader
<b>5:35 PM – 6:00 PM Recap of Recommendations</b> Overarching Principles Genesis Arizmendi Climate Conscious Neighborhoods Cassandra Miller Renewable Energy & Energy Efficiency Erica Velarde Governance & Economic Development Kevin Bean & Genesis Arizmendi Waste & Recycling Sharon Hausam Transportation Tony Sparks
<b>6:00 PM – 6:30 PM Breakout 1</b> Climate Conscious Neighborhoods Lilly Irvin-Vitela & Cassandra Miller Renewable Energy & Energy Efficiency Melanie Eastwood & Erica Velarde Governance & Economic Development Sharon Berman & Chas Robles Waste & Recycling Erika Robers Transportation Wendy Wintermute & Tony Sparks
<b>6:30 PM – 6:40 PM Report Out</b>
<b>6:40 PM – 7:10 PM Breakout 2</b> Climate Conscious Neighborhoods Lilly Irvin-Vitela & Cassandra Miller Renewable Energy & Energy Efficiency Melanie Eastwood & Erica Velarde Governance & Economic Development Sharon Berman & Chas Robles Waste & Recycling Erika Robers Transportation Wendy Wintermute & Tony Sparks
<b>7:10 PM – 7:20 PM Report Out</b>
<b>7:20 PM – 7:30 PM Wrap Up &amp; Next Steps</b> Lilly Irvin-Vitela & Kelsey Rader

**Group Agreements**

- Provide general and specific feedback.
- Share the time with other participants so everyone can be heard.
- There is an opportunity for a variety of views to be shared, and debate is unnecessary.
- Be respectful- Dissent is welcome, but interrupting, attacking, and arguing will not be tolerated.

## CITY OF ALBUQUERQUE – PUBLIC COMMENT MINUTES – 02.18.21

- In the small group, facilitators will go round-robin. Participants have the option to speak or pass.

### **Zoom Norms**

- Please keep your mics muted unless you're speaking.
- Please turn your camera on when you are speaking and identify yourself.
- If you have a question or comment in the large group, please raise your hand.

### **Breakout Group Questions**

*\*\*Notes will be taken by NMF & CABQ Staff Members. A reporter from the group will share back 2-4 ideas in 1.5-2 minutes\*\**

1. Are there any principles or recommendations that need to be clarified? If yes, please identify anything confusing.
2. Are there any principles or recommendations related to these topics that you find concerning? If yes, please briefly explain.
3. Are there any principles or recommendations that you find most impactful, promising, or hopeful?

### **Recommendations**

[CABQ Climate Action Task Force – Draft Recommendations 2021.](#)

## Overview

Recommendation Category	Questions	Concerns/Suggestions	Support
<p>Climate Conscious Neighborhoods</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Learn more about disparities between high-impact/high-risk neighborhoods related to the heat island effect?</li> <li>Describe more about marketing waste in ways that would benefit frontline communities.</li> <li>Does marketing waste include produced water?</li> <li>Describe the "Valle del Oro" model</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Need coordination with the COG and Water Resource Board</li> <li>Spell out acronyms and have a glossary</li> <li>There is currently an immense amount of research available about Sustainable Development Goals [SDGs]. I would recommend that the task force looks at the research.</li> <li>Great that the City is looking at SDGs and modeling them on a local level, but, at the same time, they need to consider how these goals have been taken advantage of by "less than friendly interests."</li> <li>One movement of particular interest is degrowth.</li> <li>See Mathias Schmeltzer's information on the hegemony of growth and market-based ideologies and management, especially regarding sustainability and the climate catastrophe.</li> <li>I do actually have a concern about the idea of food forests. I work at UNM and, in walking around campus, I wondered why there are so few food-trees there.</li> <li>One document that is really important to us is the Nature Conservancy's <a href="#">tree planting guide</a>, in which ABQ is categorized into different planting zones and, within each planting zone, they have trees and plants that are water-ready: natives, ornamentals, as well as food-producing trees.</li> <li>I have a big idea for campaigns: I think we should have a climate change parade. The schools would make floats or put on, you know, whatever. Have</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>The groundwork of economic justice is that people speak for themselves. I think it is important that the folks on the frontlines speak for themselves [...] this goes all the way back to the early Native Americans.</li> <li>I wanted to help plant trees and improve green spaces! (when taking the survey)</li> <li>I really like that you included the data dashboard and mapping as part of the plan.</li> <li>Making things visual – mapping where green space is missing – that is really helpful.</li> <li>I think that educating the public as well as greening our communities are both really interesting Ideas.</li> <li>We can impact the education departments – the reaching out to schools, to media outlets and talking about how we engage in the conversation about climate change.</li> <li>What is powerful is that the City of Albuquerque is making an earnest effort at localizing its response.</li> <li>If this is a community-based, bottom-up approach by the City that is truly profound and revolutionary...that takes a long time to do.</li> </ul>

CITY OF ALBUQUERQUE – PUBLIC COMMENT MINUTES – 02.18.21

		<p>music, have stages along the parade - a battle of the bands. How do you bring out the public to educate them? You could have the different City entities with their own stations to educate folks. Then you'd bring people together and have fun.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Young people are often our teachers.</li> <li>• Make language more accessible</li> <li>• Resiliency- I'm not sure we can really talk about sustainability anymore. We may be past that in terms of where we are in terms of climate change. So I think we need to speak about how we can be resilient in the face of all the changes we are seeing. This is slightly different than sustainability, and I think because we have to adapt. A lot of the things you are discussing [in the plan] (water, energy use) are focused on adaptations (I think - probably). What is important is that we make ourselves resilient so that we can adapt down the way.</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• If we want this to be truly effective, this plan must move slowly. Anything that the plan institutionalizes - the people and individuals who can act on that will always be the ones with power [...]. It's going to take an immense amount of time for this to be a bottom-up approach</li> <li>• We are excited to lift up school gardens as a powerful vehicle for learning about the world that we're inheriting and also for having a way to make a change in the world.</li> <li>• I find this all very exciting. I think marrying education and data and coming at this from all the angles you're coming from (not just viewing different subjects as separate spheres) is really important.</li> <li>• It is a huge project, but it seems like you've thought a lot about this and have looked at ways to have a creative impact on individual lives and the whole City.</li> </ul>
<p>Renewable Energy or Energy Efficiency</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• C-PACE is for public buildings</li> <li>• Look at energy efficiency, and C-PACE supports private entities.</li> <li>• Is there a baseline inventory of the greenhouse gases within CABQ? Hard to put some concrete # BASELINE, TARGET, and TIMELINE. Latest greenhouse gas inventory.</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• So many ideas where is the focus and priority</li> <li>• Most greenhouse gases are coming from "Buildings."</li> <li>• They are a combo of recommendations of task force actions. We need a stronger name than that!</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Noted, hold public forums to discuss and consider the costs and benefits of community, municipal, or corporate ownership of the generation, storage, transition, and solar energy distribution. We need to talk about all energy.</li> <li>• All these recs are important.</li> <li>• Focused on the community level.</li> </ul>

CITY OF ALBUQUERQUE – PUBLIC COMMENT MINUTES – 02.18.21

	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• What are we going to do with the old vehicles? Incentives can be both negative and positive.</li> <li>• How do you require building codes without low-income folks becoming a burden on them?</li> <li>• Are there members of frontline communities on the taskforce?</li> <li>• How will solar incentives work for the low income?</li> <li>• What are we doing to talk about ownership issues? We need to talk about who owns things. I want people to co-own the energy system. Decentralize our energy. Let us talk about ownership.</li> <li>• What are the barriers to solar?</li> </ul>		
<p>Governance and Economic Development</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• When you say investment, who are the actors? Are you talking about CABQ or individual businesses investing?</li> <li>• What is a resilience mapping program? Is it a technical definition or kind of like a word that means let us not destroy our environment?</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• We need a regional water budget if it's going to make sense.</li> <li>• Following farmland – need a definition and clarity about what jurisdiction the City would have.</li> <li>• Concern re. Regional and other jurisdictions.</li> <li>• Timetable - How long is the implementation strategy. Size of the area we'd like to effect and education necessary.</li> <li>• What is the rollout strategy?</li> <li>• ID-ing those properties that are watering their lawns. I think many of them won't be in the City,</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• I like what I see.</li> <li>• I appreciate the scale, the long-term view.</li> <li>• I really like the idea of sharing equipment on a community basis.</li> <li>• If there was composting availability of a machine in our neighborhood, I think many people would use that.</li> <li>• Maybe working with youth- my neighborhood association has a list of kids who want to do things.</li> </ul>

CITY OF ALBUQUERQUE – PUBLIC COMMENT MINUTES – 02.18.21

	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Is there coordination or discussion with Bernalillo County, Rio Rancho, etc.?</li> </ul>	<p>and they'll be in the county. We're all interconnected.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Economic investment - food tourism - gives me pause - tourism is a major factor of displacement and gentrification.</li> <li>See how this connects with the Interstate Stream Commission presentation on water.</li> <li>This plan needs to relate to MRGC planning for climate change.</li> <li>Marry entrepreneurial efforts and recycling in a way that creates new products or services - green jobs is one thing but to get people to work for themselves for the better.</li> <li>Recycling doesn't have a significant market except for aluminum. The City could pay someone to take some recycling categories if they could convert these items into some product they used to make park benches out of plastics. Could you get a rainforest group downtown or UNM or CNM entrepreneurial classes to focus on how to do that? Circular economy. Encourage youth to get involved, work for themselves.</li> <li>I'm concerned as a citizen with how quickly we have to move on this issue, how this is going to be implemented.</li> <li>I do not hear anything about implementation or the reality that any of this will be implemented.</li> <li>The 2009 climate action plan had many good things too - but implementation now, 10-15 years later, we have to measure it and see what comes out of it.</li> <li>The entire plan is a list of very broad recommendations and covers a lot of different areas. I'm afraid of being overwhelmed by how we sell this focused plan to decision-makers, but</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Like the retraining - green jobs - education and training.</li> <li>All of these ideas are promising and hopeful.</li> </ul>
--	---	--	---

CITY OF ALBUQUERQUE – PUBLIC COMMENT MINUTES – 02.18.21

		<p>most of all, the general public, most of whom don't believe we are facing a crisis.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• We are going to have to have a big PR campaign. We'll have to choose the biggest bang for the buck - the 3 biggest things.</li> <li>• The focus is going to be the biggest challenge.</li> </ul>	
<p>Waste Management and Recycling</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• What is meant by local markets?</li> <li>• Are you looking for markets here in Albuquerque or NM or outside of NM?</li> <li>• What would it look like to start our own recycling center here in Albuquerque that could recycle and remake the materials we don't have a market to sell elsewhere? Are there any new ideas out there that we could implement?</li> <li>• Is there air pollution from recycling?</li> <li>• Unaware of any specific air pollution-related to plastic recycling</li> <li>• Shared an article regarding research done by Yale and (Silver Springs?) Universities warn us that paper recycling is very carbon-intensive and has not caught up with paper mills using virgin materials.</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Too much of our construction waste goes into the landfill. It is extremely harmful to continue to build everything new and throw away what we demolish. Infill and rehabbing old buildings is a better use of resources.</li> <li>• Building local recycling infrastructure is a huge capital investment. Who pays?</li> <li>• We need to look at recycling as a net-economic loss until things change significantly. I am concerned that the recommendation around reinvesting recycling funds into frontline communities will not be feasible due to the net-zero economics the City experiences with recycling.</li> <li>• Composting programs may not make money but there are other concrete benefits to the community (increased soil health, reduced methane emissions, partnerships with agricultural businesses, etc.)</li> <li>• We need to be conscientious of not being condescending in our educational efforts.</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• I am hopeful that moving forward, we will see more locally-based facilities now that we are no longer outsourcing to China. We already see new corrugated cardboard companies and a growth in domestic markets than we've seen in the last 10 years.</li> <li>• Beyond this group and the work you are doing, I am given hope by the possibility of connecting the dots. For example, we have a great opportunity to connect compostable materials to local agriculture. Everyone creates compostable waste but not everyone has compost so if we can connect these two it is a win-win-win situation.</li> <li>• Composting should be all over the City at drop-off points, she drops off her own compost at local gardens but not all people are aware of this option.</li> <li>• Stickers are a great idea for bins. It's very confusing for some people to figure out what to recycle. For example, in their apartment complex, people often throw things away that could be recycled. Apartments are an ideal place to use signage and teach people what to recycle. They mentioned that often the signage on their blue bins are old and unreadable. Jill told them to call 311</li> </ul>

CITY OF ALBUQUERQUE – PUBLIC COMMENT MINUTES – 02.18.21

			<p>and ask for Jill Holbert and she would get them new signage.</p>
<p>Transportation</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• How do we convince drivers that the sacrifices they might make are worth it to the community? A tough question to answer.</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Would like to see the "meat put on the bones."</li> <li>• Clear numerical goals, e.g., increased public transit, decrease in GHGs? Answer: not yet, but that's on the agenda.</li> <li>• Coordination between the City, county and region</li> <li>• Also coordinating with industry, among neighborhoods, school districts</li> <li>• Maintenance of bus shelters is a challenge. The City has 2700 bus stops, 600 shelters, 400 with solar lights, 700 trashcans. Vandalism and theft is a problem. Maybe transit needs to allocate more resources to upkeep, even at the expense of service.</li> <li>• Create an app that would track and reward people for taking the bus, walking, biking. Display how much GHG is saved. Introduce incentives, challenges, prizes. Get businesses involved.</li> <li>• See research on what makes for effective climate change education. One recommendation is to make it very local; this is about you and your neighborhood, family, and friends.</li> <li>• Break down the science so people of all ages can easily understand it. Focus on the younger generation. Incorporate this into public school curricula.</li> <li>• Launch a visible public campaign; signs where people gather, on buses, walking paths.</li> <li>• Acknowledge the landscape. Western cities like Albuquerque were developed in the automobile age, and Albuquerque developers dominated city policies. Intelligent design was trumped by profitability.</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Public transportation implies that public transportation is accessible, easy to use, seamless, lots of times.</li> <li>• Ask neighborhoods to adopt a shelter or bus stop.</li> <li>• Get more people on the bus.</li> <li>• Getting people to walk and bike has implications for safer streets and transportation.</li> <li>• Establish safe walking, biking corridors, away from traffic.</li> <li>• Prioritize pedestrians and biking over vehicles.</li> <li>• Tension between short-term solutions like bike lanes and repairing sidewalks and the longer-term goal of changing behaviors.</li> <li>• Public awareness and education</li> </ul>



**Climate Conscious Neighborhoods – Discussion Groups 1 & 2**

**Are there any principles or recommendations that need to be clarified? If yes, please identify anything confusing.**

- I am curious about the disparity in equity between high-impact and high-risk neighborhoods and lower-income neighborhoods, particularly about the urban heat island effect and the desire to create greener spaces. [...]
  - Part of this comes from existing efforts from the City, for example, tree-planting efforts in neighborhoods that lack trees. As you might imagine, the neighborhoods which lack trees are predominantly communities of color and low-income. We want to prioritize these areas because we want to improve greening throughout the City. These are the areas most likely to experience the negative effects of the urban heat island effect. [Explanation of the urban heat island effect]
  - Regarding the plan, the nitty-gritty, how-to will be better fine-tuned once we hear feedback from the community that the task force can use to debrief their recommendations further. Also - this is a living document that will continue to be shaped the realities and needs of the community.
- Can you speak more about the idea of marketing waste so that it would benefit frontline communities? [Included in the presentation of the recommendations as a waste-related recommendation.] This idea makes me think of the Reduced Water Act recently put into order - NMSU has this \$100,000 grant to study how produced water (toxic fracking water) can be used to grow food. The lesson I learned in the context of this bill is that it's never a good idea to, instead of trying to stop the problem, seek out a market for, for example, something like produced water.
  - At no point did the task force have conversations about produced water. Rather, we aimed to tell people that there are recyclable things but that markets for these things have changed. This goal goes back to the educator idea - you need to create jobs in which trusted people can teach others how to recycle, but you also need to ensure that you have markets for that waste.
  - I don't think this solution was necessarily presented in the context of climate-conscious neighborhoods, but it –how to best recycle – is something we had lots of conversations about. People know how to recycle, but the benefits are so disengaged from the individual that we seek to really make the benefits of recycling apparent.
  - I want to acknowledge that if this is talking about waste specifically, that is all well and good. Still, I think it is important to anticipate and be aware of how that language can be taken advantage of by the institution to market more toxic forms of these strategies. This is something I'm concerned about and wanted to bring up.
  - This contribution is a really helpful and will help us consider how we can tighten up our language.
- There were a couple of times when specific terms were used in the survey that weren't helpful. For example, "the Valle del Oro model". I felt that this phrase, amongst others, wasn't very helpful because it was very specific.
- Yes, this has come up. One idea we had was to hyperlink these phrases, but this doesn't work in SurveyMonkey. This is something we will be focusing on for the final plan.
- In promoting food security, I'm not sure there was a cross-purpose in what was being promoted. On the one hand: when you say you want to do fallowing of lands, most of them are outside the City. So, it sounds like you want to have a fallowing program so that I [someone in the City] can

use more water for my land in the City. I think creating a farmland program in the City that might include fallowing would be helpful. [missed notes Acronym - NMISC? NMNRDC?] has a pilot program for fallowing.

- There are sometimes regional efforts - like the water resources board, with the COG [Council of Governments]. Ensuring that those agencies can collaborate is important. For example, today's Interstate Stream Commission had a roll out of their new 50 year water plan, which will focus very much on climate change. They are partnering with USGS and the Army Corps and others. It is important to remember that there is a lot of good work going on – we live in the basin, not a little silo.

**Are there any principles or recommendations related to these topics that you find concerning? If yes, explain.**

- I don't have anything specific off the top of my head.
- I am actually here with my partner, and we are both passionate about this stuff.
- I think there is currently an immense amount of research available about Sustainable Development Goals [SDGs]. This is important because when these goals were initially developed, they were phrased in ways that market and capitalize on nature. I would recommend that the task force looks at the research.
- It is great that the City is looking at SDGs and modeling them on a local level but, at the same time, they need to consider how these goals have been taken advantage of by "less than friendly interests". Unfortunately, those who are the less than friendly interests are really good at navigating the policy landscape and framework that the City is laying down at this moment.
- An immense amount of research has been done on NAFTA [North American Free Trade Agreement] and CAFTA [Dominican Republic-Central America Free Trade Agreement].
- Feel Free to share any particular resources.
- One movement of particular interest is degrowth. I posed this idea to the economic development director at the time when Mayor Keller had his first town hall. This degrowth theory presents an understanding of the hegemony and domination of the growth ideology in our systems. The growth ideology produces many effects in local municipalities. These municipalities are incompetent when it comes to an understanding it because the municipality as a corporation still has to operate on understandings of growth and constant growth.
- Mathias Schmeltzer has an immense amount of information on the hegemony of growth and market-based ideologies and management, especially regarding sustainability and the climate catastrophe. Climate change and the other dilemma that is: we have turned all of our commons into capital (things like laptops, homes, for example). There is an immense amount of research - we have to depend on the market to an extent, there is a phase-out process for this, but we have to be firm on how we critique and what language we use to create goals.
- The groundwork of economic justice is that people speak for themselves. I think it is important that the folks on the frontlines speak for themselves [...] this goes all the way back to the early Native Americans. I am a settler on this land, and I do not want to make decisions or dominate conversations.
- The survey is also a great opportunity to share your ideas and your feedback about the recommendations.
- I didn't find anything that gave me pause - while taking the survey, I found that I was super excited. I want to help plant trees and improve green spaces! I really like that you included the data dashboard and mapping as part of the plan.

- Making things visual – mapping where green space is missing – that is really helpful. I think that educating the public as well as greening our communities are both really interesting Ideas.
- I do actually have a concern about the idea of food forests. I work at UNM and, in walking around campus, I wondered why there are so few food-trees there. Someone said to me once (and I am unsure if they had any authority) that there was concern over homeless people eating that food, which sounds super strange.
- The City of Santa Fe is already doing good work in this realm- they do plant fruit trees that aren't sprayed with pesticides; they're edible, so people can, for example, just bring over a laundry basket and collect their apricots. We have to think that sometimes we have [...] inherently conflicting policies within a plan. We have a long history in this country regarding which people we believe are deserving or undeserving. That worms its way into policy all the time. I hear your words as a social concern about ensuring that people have access to their basic needs.
- Another consideration that was really important to the task force was planting things that make sense in our area. One document that is really important to us is the Nature Conservancy's [tree planting guide](#), in which ABQ is categorized into different planting zones and, within each planting zone, they have trees and plants that are water-ready: natives, ornamentals, as well as food-producing trees.
- I have a big idea for campaigns: I think we should have a climate change parade. The schools would make floats or put on, you know, whatever. Have music, have stages along the parade - a battle of the bands. How do you bring out the public to educate them? You could have the different City entities with their own stations to educate folks. Then you'd bring people together and have fun. I did water parades across the border, between Columbus [TX] and Palomas [Puerto Palomas, Chihuahua, Mexico]. We got 1000 people to the water festival in Palomas, and this was in part because the kids were all involved.
- Isn't that a powerful way to change social norms? Young people are often our teachers.

**Are there any principles or recommendations that you find most impactful, promising, or hopeful?**

- A particularly potent way we can impact is through the education departments – reaching out to schools, media outlets and talking about how we engage in the conversation about climate change. This would be a potent tool because it often becomes an elitist thing in how this information is disseminated. Even in how it's written - it can be very dense. For people that might not have had the privilege of higher education or who struggled through school, sometimes the language in which solutions are presented is intimidating and makes the information unpalatable to folks.
- Yes. This is so aligned with what task force members deliberated.
- What is powerful is that the City of Albuquerque is making an earnest effort at localizing its response. It really needs to take wind to that. In some of the presentations earlier, I heard: national response, nationally coordinated response. That is top-down, not bottom-up. We are trying to do [...] Well, cities don't ever want to do anything first, but they also don't want to do it last.
- If this is a community-based, bottom-up approach by the City that is truly profound and revolutionary...that takes a long time to do. To work in a frontline community goes back to the [aforementioned] code-switching idea: the reason folks don't do that, for example, is seen in the Zapatistas of Chiapas and the Mexican government - the Mexican government doesn't like working with the Zapatistas because it takes them [the Zapatistas] two weeks to do what it takes the government two hours to do. if we want this to be truly effective, this plan must move slowly. Anything that the plan institutionalizes - the people and individuals who can act on that will always be the ones with power [...]. It's going to take an immense amount of time for this to be a bottom-up approach – we have to remember that.

- I was excited to lift up school gardens as a powerful vehicle for learning about the world that we're inheriting and also for having a way to make change in the world. That's the work that I see and experience - I hope it can be built out so that we are leaning on the community and on the groups already working on this. I often see that I am wary of how outdoor classrooms and greening the City have become all the rage in the current moment. I hope that they don't just become another tool that we try to profit off of.
- I feel like I might have answered this already but I find this all very exciting. I think marrying education and data and coming at this from all the angles you're coming from (not just viewing different subjects as separate spheres) is really important. Its a huge project but it seems like you've thought a lot about this and have looked at ways to have creative impact on individual lives and the whole City. I'm wondering what else we can do to help because this is such a huge undertaking. I'm also wondering what the timeline will be.
  - Yes - yesterday we got a question about the timeline, which raised concerns such as: What if the administration changes? From a convenient point of view, one of the big reminders is that this is long-term work. It's not all overnight. From an organizer perspective, I share the point of view that no matter what the administration is, it's harder to ignore highly organized people who impact things they care about deeply. It is upon us to ensure we have a critical mass in the future. I appreciate your thinking about the timeline - there is both that sense of urgency and that long-term view.
  - I have some input regarding the more short-term perspective. The CAP is currently in the draft phase, in March we will collect all community feedback and incorporate that into a finalized draft in the hope of putting that up to city council in April and beginning implementation in June of this year. Then annual updates will come every year after that in June. So if you haven't heard anything by June, we, as community members can push it forward, and say to the department: [hey, where is the action?].
  - As community members, you can think of and contribute ideas of how to move the plan forward.
- Anything else you want to discuss?
  - Resiliency. I'm not sure we can really talk about sustainability anymore. We may be past that in terms of where we are in terms of climate change. So I think we need to speak about how we can be resilient in the face of all the changes we are seeing. This is slightly different than sustainability I think, because we have to adapt. A lot of the things you are discussing [in the plan] (water, energy use) are focused on adaptations (I think - probably). What is important is that we make ourselves resilient so that we can adapt down the way.
  - I feel the truth in what you are saying, The beauty, but also the grief that we might have moved past sustainability and that we have to change our language to accommodate this.
  - We were doing that [using the language of sustainability] 20 years ago and [...].
  - This is Albuquerque, but how would this translate for the state? Would this be something that could be adapted as a larger version? Is there a plan for that?

#### **Renewable Energy & Energy Efficiency – Discussion Groups 1 & 2**

**Are there any principles or recommendations that need to be clarified? If yes, please identify anything confusing.**

- See paced is for public buildings Look at energy efficiency and C-PACE supports private entities.

## CITY OF ALBUQUERQUE – PUBLIC COMMENT MINUTES – 02.18.21

- So many ideas: what is the focus? What are priorities? Is there a baseline inventory of the greenhouse gases within CABQ? Hard to put some concrete # BASELINE, TARGET and TIMELINE. Latest greenhouse gas inventory.
- Gave a summary of greenhouse gas contributions. Based on lots of data sources. PNM, etc. Measures from 2008-2017 in that time there was not a huge decline. Most is coming from "Buildings."
- What are we going to do with the old vehicles? Incentives can be both negative and positive.
- Building codes in Frontline Communities. Frontline communities have better access. How do you require needed changes without it becoming a burden to low-income people.
- The City will take the recommendations. This is something that always came up so that we don't hurt the frontline communities.
- Are there members of frontline committees in the taskforce? We asked people to apply who were part of the frontline communities. Make the survey general but also did targeted outreach. A task force member talked about her experience being part of a frontline community.
- How will solar incentives work for the low income? Did not go into specific items. Brought up the social tax incentive you must have a tax liability. So, you can never take advantage of the credit. Working with prosperity working with low-income housings to retrofit the homes. Extremely important to learn where the City can fit into these low energy low-income upgrades.
- What are we doing to talk about ownership issues? We need to talk about who owns things. I want people to co-own the energy system. Decentralize our energy. Let us talk about ownership.
- Noted, that is very brave of you to say and this is a conversation that we had during the taskforce. Does not know how this will go.
- Will aspirational ideas, like the idea of the owning class, be in the report.
- Noted, hold public forums to discuss and consider the costs and benefits of community, municipal, or corporate ownership of the generation, storage, transition, and solar energy distribution. D-cent project. We need to talk about all energy.

**Are there any principles or recommendations related to these topics that you find concerning? If yes, explain.**

- They are a combo of recommendations of task force recommendations and actions. We need a stronger name than that!

**Are there any principles or recommendations that you find most impactful, promising, or hopeful?**

- All these recs are important and need to be jumped in with two feet.
- It is happening on the community level.
- Why can't we get solar energy? Lobbyists stop solar energy. There are some more renewable energies. It has come down to politics. Community Solar will happen. It may be this year, or further down the road.

### Governance & Economic Development – Discussion Groups 1 & 2

**Are there any principles or recommendations that need to be clarified? If yes, please identify anything confusing.**

## CITY OF ALBUQUERQUE – PUBLIC COMMENT MINUTES – 02.18.21

- There's going to have to be a regional water budget if it's going to make sense. Looks like with regional transportation, regional. To link with other metrics, it's not just a water budget to look at energy and land use budgets. Response: that's what we were thinking of doing,
- Following farmland - definition - and what jurisdiction the City would have. MRGC is implementing following programs now. Concerned when the City says "we should follow."
  - Chas responded - wanting to consider encouraging local farming. The less greenhouse gases, the more economic development for frontline communities, the best. The following was considering how farmlands being utilized, how water is being used. The objective was supporting farm to table tourism as an economic opportunity. Create food growth.
- When you say investment, who are the actors? Are you talking about CABQ or individual businesses investing?
  - Response: we do not want outsiders coming in and taking opportunities coming in. Keeping the \$\$ in NM. Thanks for noting that specificity could be brought in.
- What is a resilience mapping program? Is it a technical definition or kind of like a word that means let us not destroy our environment?
  - Response - the maps around the City, from tree cover to areas underdeveloped historically throughout the City. All sectors: transportation where there are no routes to tree cover in certain regions to thinking about addressing those areas historically underserved and working toward improving those areas.
  - So, this is making information available to a broad set of users. That is a great idea!
  - Response - that can be critical mapping infrastructure that will be vulnerable to climate change.
- Is there coordination or discussion with Bernalillo County, Rio Rancho, etc.?
  - Response: That is something we'll need to do. Also, there was a comment that some of these recommendations must be taken to the County Water Board. We need to be having these kinds of conversations. We are the CABQ climate action task force, making recommendations.

### **Are there any principles or recommendations related to these topics that you find concerning? If yes, explain.**

- Following is the problem. Fresno promotes it as food security.
- Concern re. Regional and other jurisdictions.
- Timetable - How long is the implementation strategy. Size of the area we'd like to effect and education necessary. Rollout strategy? Response- climate action water budget - what present and future water supply will be impacted by climate. Will force prioritization of water use. Irrigation rights to grow big lawns. Response: there's an immediate need to get things done and there's a need to get things done - short and long time. Trying to balance immediate need. This is both a marathon and a sprint. It will take coalition building, relationship building.
- This is a societal shift. We've got to do the work every day.
- ID-ing those properties that are watering their lawns. I think many of them won't be in the City, and they'll be in the county. We're all interconnected.
- Economic investment - food tourism - gives me pause - tourism is a major factor of displacement and gentrification—Justice frame of mind.
- The Interstate Stream Commission had a presentation on water. When we talk about partnering and leveraging, recognizing state is addressing it. Also MRGC planning for climate change. They will be coming up with new water data. CABQ needs to be tied into it and turning it around for residents. Council of Governments has a water resources board, which CABQ is a member of

- Marry entrepreneurial efforts and recycling in a way that creates new products or services - green jobs is one thing but to get people to work for themselves the better. Recycling doesn't have a great market except aluminum. City could pay someone to take some recycling categories if they could convert these items into some product, they used to make park benches out of plastics. Could you get rainforest group downtown, or UNM or CNM entrepreneurial classes to focus on how to do that. Circular economy. Encourage youth to get involved, work for themselves.
  - Response: more opportunities for the younger population, moving toward sustainable job opportunities. Response - what impacts are we having if we are shipping our waste to other countries and areas.
- I'm concerned as a citizen with how quickly we have to move on this issue, how this is going to be implemented. I'm gathering from communications and tonight's discussion that a lot of what I'm concerned about will be some time in the future. I'm not hearing anything about implementation or the reality that any of this will be implemented. The 2009 climate action plan had many good things too - but implementation now, 10-15 years, later, we have to measure it and see what comes out of it.
- The entire plan is a list of very broad recommendations and covers a lot of different areas. I'm afraid of being overwhelmed by how we sell this focused plan to decision-makers, but most of all, the general public, most of whom don't believe we are facing a crisis. They're not going to buy it. We are going to have to have a big PR campaign. We'll have to choose the biggest bang for the buck - the 3 biggest things. The focus is going to be the biggest challenge, I imagine.
  - Response: We want this to be implemented quickly. We're facing crises throughout the country and the world. Going in and really working on public education to combat misinformation about climate change.

**Are there any principles or recommendations that you find most impactful, promising, or hopeful?**

- I like what I see. I appreciate the scale, the long-term view.
- I really like the idea of sharing equipment on a community basis. If there was composting availability of a machine in our neighborhood, I think a lot of people would use that. Now that Rowlands is out, it's a long way to rent something. Localizing composting to our neighborhoods. Maybe working with youth- my neighborhood association has a list of kids who want to do things.
- Like the retraining - green jobs - education and training. Our economy is so dependent on oil.
- All of these ideas are promising and hopeful.

**Waste Management & Recycling – Discussion Groups 1 & 2**

**Are there any principles or recommendations that need to be clarified? If yes, please identify anything confusing.**

- What is meant by local markets? Are you looking for markets here in Albuquerque or NM or outside of NM?
- The intention has been to create jobs for frontline communities through recycling and reusing materials. We definitely don't want to import any more waste here. The materials collected to recycle here in the City do have markets. In the glass situation, their partner went out of business and now they have to ship the glass waste to Phoenix, and it's a net loss economically. Costs more to ship them than they make so it is not a long-term solution.



- What would it look like to start our own recycling center here in Albuquerque that could recycle and remake the materials we don't have a market to sell elsewhere? Are there any new ideas out there that we could implement?
- We are too small of a city to have a large company that recycles relocate here. Typically recycling factories are located in densely populated areas such as California and the rest of us ship to them. Compost makes the most sense when it comes to what we can do the most with here. We do recycle and repurpose bikes here.
- I am hopeful that moving forward, we will see more locally-based facilities now that we are no longer outsourcing to China. We already see new corrugated cardboard companies and a growth in domestic markets than we've seen in the last 10 years.
- Too much of our construction waste goes into the landfill. It is extremely harmful to continue to build everything new and throw away what we demolish. Infill and rehabbing old buildings is a better use of resources.

**Are there any principles or recommendations related to these topics that you find concerning? If yes, explain.**

- Building local recycling infrastructure is a huge capital investment. Will the city front this cost, or will we look for a large company to come in and take that task?
- We need to look at recycling as a net-economic loss until things change significantly. I am concerned that the recommendation around reinvesting recycling funds into frontline communities will not be feasible due to the net-zero economics the City experiences with recycling.
- Composting programs may not make money but there are other concrete benefits to the community (increased soil health, reduced methane emissions, partnerships with agricultural businesses, etc.)
- We need to be conscientious of not being condescending in our educational efforts. Adults who do not recycle may feel guilty so if external sources tell them they "should" be doing it is no way to change their behavior.

**Are there any principles or recommendations that you find most impactful, promising, or hopeful?**

- Beyond this group and the work you are doing, I am given hope by the possibility of connecting the dots. For example, we have a great opportunity to connect compostable materials to local agriculture. Everyone creates compostable waste but not everyone has a compost so if we can connect these two it is a win-win-win situation.
- Composting should be all over the City at drop-off points, she drops off her own compost at local gardens but not all people are aware of this option.
- Stickers are a great idea for bins. It's very confusing for some people to figure out what to recycle. For example, in their apartment complex, people often throw things away that could be recycled. Apartments are an ideal place to use signage and teach people what to recycle. They mentioned that often the signage on their blue bins are old and unreadable. Jill told them to call 311 and ask for Jill Holbert and she would get them new signage.

**General Questions**

- Is there air pollution from recycling?
- Unaware of any specific air pollution-related to plastic recycling



- Shared an article regarding research done by Yale and (Silver Springs?) Universities that warn us that paper recycling is very carbon-intensive and has not caught up with paper mills using virgin materials.

### Transportation – Discussion Groups 1 & 2

**Are there any principles or recommendations that need to be clarified? If yes, please identify anything confusing.**

- I would like to see the "meat put on the bones."
- Has the City set any numerical goals, e.g., increased public transit, decrease in GHGs? Answer: not yet, but that's on the agenda.
- Is there coordination between the City, county, and region? Answer: yes, some.
- Also coordinating with industry, among neighborhoods, school districts

**Are there any principles or recommendations related to these topics that you find concerning? If yes, explain.**

- Maintenance of bus shelters is a challenge. The City has 2700 bus stops, 600 shelters, 400 with solar lights, 700 trashcans. Vandalism and theft are a problem. Maybe transit needs to allocate more resources to upkeep, even at the expense of service.

**Are there any principles or recommendations that you find most impactful, promising, or hopeful?**

- Public transportation as a social service? Yes. This implies that public transportation is accessible, easy to use, seamless, lots of times. Climate change requires a holistic solution. Framing this as a social service is important.
- Ask neighborhoods to adopt a shelter or bus stop.
- Get more people on the bus.
  - Use public transit by riding with a friend.
  - Also stories about walking and biking. Humanizing bus riders and pedestrians. These are your neighbors, your friends.
  - Create an app that would track and reward people for taking the bus, walking, biking. Display how much GHG is saved. Introduce incentives, challenges, prizes. Get businesses involved.
- Safety
  - Like wearing masks during COVID to protect ourselves and others, the same is true for slowing down while driving
  - Getting people to walk and bike has implications for safer streets and transportation.
  - Establish safe walking, biking corridors, away from traffic. Prioritize pedestrians and biking over vehicles.
  - Tension between short-term solutions like bike lanes and repairing sidewalks and longer-term goal of changing behaviors. Safe and accessible corridors may help draw people into walking and biking.
- Public awareness and education
  - How do we convince drivers that the sacrifices they might make are worth it to the community? A tough question to answer.

- Has been reading research on what makes for effective climate change education. One recommendation is to make it very local; this is about you and your neighborhood, family, and friends.
- Break down the science so people of all ages can easily understand it. Focus on the younger generation. Incorporate this into public school curricula.
- APS is also going to be piloting a "Vision Zero for Youth" program that will include a curriculum about traffic safety
- Launch a visible public campaign; signs where people gather, on buses, walking paths.
- Acknowledge the landscape. Western cities like Albuquerque were developed in the automobile age, and Albuquerque developers dominated city policies. Intelligent design was trumped by profitability.

## Report Out

**Transportation-** We talked up really a lot about this big idea of how do we get people to want to be best writers want to be walkers, so really just kind of that was our big thing that we talked a lot about different opportunities for that. But the great idea that Laura shared with us was kind of creating some incentives, maybe like a competition for people to offset their carbon emissions by walking and biking and taking transit and so kind of turning that into a game of buying a little bit.

I think one of our bigger ideas was having not just repairing sidewalks and things but thinking beyond that and really having it be about having corridors between areas that are really safe and accessible for pedestrians and bikes and putting that priority higher instead of it just being kind of set aside for vehicle priority and then that led into a discussion of how we can successfully educate and market that to people and have people buy into that which is a difficult task, but basically that there's an importance to that to moving into that. Focus on the non-vehicle traffic.

**Waste & Recycling-** We were talking a lot about how building from scratch/building new construction often involves tearing down old things and a lot of waste and that like adaptive reuse is a better way to go when it comes to both energy efficiency as well as recycling, reusing, and just using last in general. At the very end, this phrase came up that I think is really great: refuse, reduce, reuse, repurpose, and recycle. In other words, if we cannot deal with the waste in the first place will have much less to recycle on the back end and I'll just say that if you know most people don't shop it, you know, in the world don't shop at you know, Whole Foods or even Trader Joes, but if you go to where they do shop like Walmart for groceries, everything is in plastic. Why are we absorbing all the cost of recycling all that plastic when it's the manufacturing companies who manufacture all these products, decided to put everything in plastic and then we have to deal with it. That's a whole other issue that's beyond the scope of CABQ, but it's definitely an issue was thinking about.

**Governance & Economic Development-**I think the overarching conversation was the scope of the recommendations. It would be really long term with a necessity, and it needs to do something and start acting now. People brought up the idea of a water budget, I think, was the biggest thing in it as a tool to help people realize the reality of the water situation that we're facing I guess is that fair, that would be. It links the water budget, making it regional like the transportation and linking it with the other metrics. I wanted just to add one thing real quick, Lilly: we got some great feedback just on language, and you know, as intentional as we were, as the committee to create and craft this language. Great to get that

feedback from the community on maybe some areas that we could continue to refine and focus in to ensure that we're upholding our principles that we set out outlined in the beginning.

Marrying recycling and in job, economic or any economic development, creation of jobs. So, paying somebody or an organization to take recyclable materials and then turn them into marketable products was a good one. Then I want to mention that the current idea of moving beyond CABQ to regionalization, making sure that those conversations happen came up again, which was both sessions.

**Renewable Energy & Energy Efficiency-** On this subject, there were questions about the data and what data we had previously regarding greenhouse gas emissions. If we had that based off the different industries or you know residential versus commercial versus industrial. It's easier to make the case if we had it a little more concise if the data was a little bit easier if the data was slightly more tangible. If we had like a pie chart which would show where we are now to show what percentage of greenhouse gas emissions comes from transportation what percentage from residential what percentage from commercial institutional so in all the different categories, then people can more identify oh how am I involved.

The big idea is Community ownership of all energy so democratizing in and creating a citizen's ownership of solar energy, any energy that we have the people should own it.

**Climate Conscious Neighborhoods-** We covered quite a bit of information so teary you and you can jump in at any time and help fill in. Still, one of the things that we talked about was the need for fine-tuned specific language around what we're what people are proposing. Some of these ideas, you know that there's a large institution against these yeah the possibilities that green initiatives have and so there's a need to have very specific language, as well as a real want and need in that to have frontline communities and communities that are normally more marginalized be an integral part of coming up with a framework and ways that this information is disseminated.

When we talked about invest in public education campaigns, etc, we should do something fun, so my idea was that, what about having a climate change parade. That could be all kinds of different things, you can add into that, but that was my big idea.

### Next Steps

- Please encourage your networks to take the [Draft Recommendations 2021 Survey](#) by the deadline: 5:00 PM on Friday, February 26, 2021. The survey includes each potential principle, recommendation, and strategy identified by the Climate Action Plan Task Force for the Climate Action Plan's next iteration.
- Feedback from community meetings and survey results will go back to the Task Force to inform the priority climate action principles, strategies, and tactics in the final climate action plan.
- Once recommendations and strategies are prioritized, Task Force members will identify the timeline for recommendations, metrics, potential constraints, and benefits.

**CITY OF ALBUQUERQUE – PUBLIC COMMENT MINUTES – 02.18.21**

- The final draft will be formatted and reviewed by the City of Albuquerque. The only caveat on recommendations that would not be advanced from the Task Force would be if a suggestion were illegal. The plan will be released publicly on Earth Day in April 2021. Ongoing reporting on progress will come from the City of Albuquerque Office of Sustainability.