



Landmarks & Urban
Conservation Commission



Agenda Number: 4
Case No.: 12-LUCC-50046
Project # 1002209
November 14, 2012

Staff Report

Agent	Studio SW Architects (Daniel Solares Jr.)	<p>Staff Recommendation</p> <p><i>APPROVAL of Case # 12-LUCC-50046, Project #1002209, a request for a Certificate of Appropriateness for alteration based on the findings beginning on page 8 and subject to the condition on page 9.</i></p> <p>Maryellen Hennessy, Senior Planner Staff Planner</p>
Applicant	Bank of the Rio Grande and San Felipe Plaza owners association.	
Request	Certificate of Appropriateness for alteration	
Legal Description	Building E Tract C Sheraton Old Town Inn Complex	
Address/Location	2101 Mountain Road NW	
Size	3.5 ac.	
Zoning	C-2	
Historic Location	Old Town Buffer Zone	

Summary of Analysis

The application is for a Certificate of Appropriateness to make alterations to the exterior of the building. The property is located in the 300-foot transition zone surrounding the H-1 zone. The building was constructed circa 1994 in a Northern New Mexico Vernacular style, as a single-story, 5,200 square foot multi-tenant retail building.

The applicants propose to remove the existing doors and windows as well as the stucco infill in many of the window openings. The head height of the existing openings would be increased from 6'8 to 8'0. New wood clad doors and double hung windows will be installed. Window trim will be removed and replaced with a more traditional pediment detail. New trim will match existing. Some windows on the north side will be closed off. Wood columns will be stabilized with cement bases where drainage problems have undermined the structure. The applicants also propose to add glazing on all three sides of the existing decorative roof dormers for interior light wells. Stucco will be patched and repaired and a new color coat applied to the entire building.

This request for a Certificate of Appropriateness for alteration has been reviewed against the Development Guidelines and the criteria for approval of a Certificate of Appropriateness contained in the LUC Ordinance. The applicant's proposal to make alterations to does not conflict with the development guidelines and is eligible for a Certificate of Appropriateness.

PRIMARY REFERENCES:

Landmarks and Urban Conservation Ordinance; §14-16-2-25, Design Guidelines for the Old Town Historic Zone.

Development Review Division Report:

SUMMARY OF REQUEST

<i>Requests</i>	<i>Certificate of Appropriateness for alteration</i>
<i>Historic Location</i>	<i>Old Town Buffer Zone</i>

AREA HISTORY AND CHARACTER

Surrounding architectural styles, historic character and recent (re)development

	<i># of Stories</i>	<i>Roof Configuration, Architectural Style and Approximate Age of Construction</i>	<i>Historic Classification & Land Use</i>
<i>General Area</i>	1-2	Flat; Pitched (gabled and hipped), Carpenter Gothic, Spanish-Pueblo Revival and contemporary interpretations; Territorial Revival, Brick Commercial, 1796 – 1990’s.	Contributing, Unclassified Residential and Commercial
<i>Site to the North</i>	2	Flat roofed, Modified Spanish Pueblo Revival circa	Unclassified
<i>Sites to the South</i>	1	Flat, Spanish Pueblo Revival	Unclassified
<i>Sites to the East</i>	1	Flat, contemporary.	Unclassified
<i>Site to the West</i>	2	Flat roofed, Modified Spanish Pueblo Revival circa	Unclassified

II INTRODUCTION

Proposal

The request is for a Certificate of Appropriateness to make alterations to the exterior of the building in the 300-foot buffer zone surrounding H-1. The building was constructed circa 1994 in a Northern New Mexico Vernacular style, as a single-story, 5,200 square foot multi-tenant retail building.

The applicants propose to remove the existing doors and windows as well as the stucco infill in many of the window openings. The head height of the existing openings would be increased from 6’8 to 8’0. New wood clad doors and double hung windows will be installed. Window trim will be removed and replaced with a more traditional pediment detail. New trim will match existing. Some windows on the north side will be closed off. Wood columns will be stabilized with cement bases where drainage problems have undermined the structure. The applicants also propose to add glazing on all three sides of the existing decorative roof dormers for interior light wells. Stucco will be patched and repaired and a new color coat applied to the entire building. The project includes a new ATM to be located on the north (interior) side of the building.

Context

The subject building fronts on Mountain Road and is located at the northeast corner of the intersection of Mountain Road and San Felipe.

The Historic Old Town Zone encompasses an area roughly between Mountain Road and Central Ave. on the north and south, and Rio Grande Blvd. and the 19th St. on the west and east. The historic zone was created with the adoption of the City's first zoning Code in 1959 to preserve and promote the educational, cultural and general welfare of the public through the preservation of protection of the traditional architectural character of historic old Albuquerque.

The Spanish Colonial, Territorial or Western Victorian architectural styles of buildings and structures erected prior to 1912 in the area now constituted as the State of New Mexico comprise the traditional architectural character of the H-1 Zone.

Inside of this historic zone is the state registered "Old Albuquerque Historic District". The Old Albuquerque Historic District is a sub-set of the Old Town Historic Zone. The historic district is the core of the Hispano village of Albuquerque, founded in 1706, and the main village in the area until the arrival of the railroad in 1880. The church and plaza are at the center of the district, as in most Hispanic villages of New Mexico.

A Certificate of Appropriateness is also required for alterations in the area surrounding the H-1 Zone to a distance of three hundred feet, excluding right-of-ways. The property falls within this "buffer" or transitional boundary.

History

The complex of buildings at this location were constructed between 1970's and 1990's and reflect regional styles. The buildings are not historic. Many of the windows in the subject building were filled and stuccoed over in 2002 and the main entry re-located to the east side from the south side.

APPLICABLE PLANS, ORDINANCES, DESIGN GUIDELINES & POLICIES

III. ANALYSIS

Policies are written in regular text and staff analysis and comment in bold italic print.

Comprehensive Zoning Code

The Old Town Historic Zone was designated in 1959 with the adoption of the first Zoning Code for the City of Albuquerque. Old Town was recognized even then as a very special location within Albuquerque, and the H-1 Zone was designated specifically to address the development within Old Town. Signage, architectural style, and permissive uses are controlled through the H-1 Zoning. The H-1 Zone was later amended to include a 300 foot "buffer" zone surrounding Old Town to ensure a coherent visual character for the surrounding neighborhood.

Any construction, alteration or demolition, which would affect the exterior appearance of any structure within 300 feet of the H-1 zone, shall not be undertaken until the Landmarks and Urban Conservation Commission has approved a Certificate of Appropriateness. Procedures relating to the issuance of a Certificate of Appropriateness are prescribed in Chapter 14, Article 12, Landmarks and Urban Conservation and the standards for architectural style and visual character shall be the same as those for the H-1 Historic Zone.

The Code also provides that the adopted specific development guidelines may provide exemptions to the requirement or provide for City staff approval in lieu of Landmarks and Urban Conservation Commission approval.

An analysis of the proposal's conformance with the adopted specific development guidelines and the criteria for approval of a Certificate of Appropriateness is provided below.

Development Guidelines for the Old Town Historic Zone and Buffer Zone

Design Guidelines (as amended through April 9,1998) have been adopted by the Landmarks and Urban Conservation Commission for building projects in the H-1 Historic Old Town Zone. The Specific Design Guidelines for the Old Town Historic District also apply to the buffer zone within 300 feet of the historic district. The Guidelines are general, and along with standards applicable to the rehabilitation of historic properties, they address contemporary new buildings and pedestrian safety.

1. Every reasonable effort should be made to provide a compatible use for buildings which will require minimum alteration to the building and its environment.
2. Rehabilitation work should not destroy the distinguishing qualities or character of the property and its environment. The removal or alteration of any historic material or architectural features should be held to the minimum, consistent with the proposed use.
3. Deteriorated architectural features should be repaired rather than replaced, wherever possible. In the event replacement is necessary, the new material should match the material being replaced in

composition, design, color, texture, and other visual qualities. Repair or replacement of missing architectural features should be based on accurate duplications of original features, substantiated by physical or pictorial evidence rather than on conjectural designs of the availability of different architectural features from other buildings.

4. Distinctive stylistic features or examples of skilled craftsmanship which characterize older structure and often predate the mass production of building materials should be treated with sensitivity.
5. Many changes to buildings and environments which have taken place in the course of time are evidence of the history of the building and the neighborhood. These changes may have developed significance in their own right, and this significance should be recognized and respected.
6. All buildings should be recognized as products of their own time. Alterations to create an appearance inconsistent with the actual character of the building should be discouraged.
7. The design and general appearance of any development or alteration in the Old Town Historic Zone should be limited to the range of design options possible and commonly chosen in Albuquerque prior to the opening of the Santa Fe Railroad in April 1880. The design of any alteration to currently existing structures erected between 1880 and 1912 should be limited to the range of design options possible and commonly chosen at the time of the building ' s construction.
8. Contemporary design for new buildings and additions to existing buildings or landscaping in the 300 foot transition zone surrounding the Old Town Historic Zone should not be discouraged if such design is compatible with the size, scale, color, material, and character of the neighborhood, buildings, or its environment.
9. Wherever possible, new additions or alterations to buildings should be done in such a manner that if they were to be removed in the future, the essential form and integrity of the original building would be unimpaired.
10. Every effort should be made to safeguard the public welfare along vehicular and pedestrian traffic ways. Placement of walls, building projections, fences, planters, shrubs, signs, ramps, steps, etc. should be planned and positioned so that they do not present a potential hazard. Provisions for the handicapped should be planned so that the essential character of the property is not damaged.
11. Any security device that prevents major features of doors and windows such as ornament, panels, glass panes, and mullions from being seen are prohibited.
12. Property owners are considering installing security devices are urged to contact LUCC staff for advice and a free handout on how to increase security without detracting from the historic character of a building.
13. An application for a Certificate of Appropriateness for work, which does not require any type of building or construction permit, may be approved by staff.

Guidelines 6 and 8 are most applicable to this application. The remainder of the guidelines are intended to address alterations to historic buildings. The removal of the window infill reverses an alteration that is not particularly complimentary to the building or the district.

The alterations are appropriate and will upgrade the appearance of the building while keeping the northern New Mexico Vernacular appearance.

The installation of glazing on the existing roof dormers might be considered “contemporary” as referenced in Guidelines #8, however; the site is in buffer zone, where contemporary treatment is acceptable. The building should not be interpreted as an historic building.

Landmarks and Urban Conservation Ordinance

This site consists of a contributing property in the Old Town Historic Zone and the project is subject to certain provisions of the Landmarks and Urban Conservation Ordinance (Article 12, R.O.A., 1994). The purpose of this ordinance is to:

“Preserve, protect, enhance, perpetuate and promote the use of structures and areas of historical, cultural, architectural, engineering, archeological or geographic significance located in the city; to strengthen the city’s economic base by stimulating the tourist industry; to enhance the identity of the city by protecting the city’s heritage and prohibiting the unnecessary destruction or defacement of its cultural assets; and to conserve existing urban developments as viable economic and social entities.”

Section 14-12-8 (A) of the LUC ordinance provides that:

“Within the boundaries of a historic zone, urban conservation overlay zone, or landmark site, the exterior appearance of any structure shall not be altered, new structures shall not be constructed, and existing structures shall not be demolished until a Certificate of Appropriateness has been duly approved.”

Section 14-12-8 (A) of the LUC ordinance provides criteria for approval of a Certificate of Appropriateness:

§14-12-8-B- (1) The change is consistent with the designation ordinance and specific development guidelines for the historic overlay zone.

As discussed in the analysis above, the proposed alterations do not conflict with the designation ordinance or the development guidelines.

§14-12-8 (B) (2) The architectural character, historical value, or archaeological value of the structure or site itself or of any historic zone in which it is located will not be significantly impaired or diminished.

The architectural character of the site or the historic zone will not be significantly impaired or diminished as analyzed above.

§14-12-8 (B) (3) The change qualified as a “certified rehabilitation: pursuant to the Tax Reform Act of 1976.

Not applicable.

§14-12-8 (B) (4) The structure or site’s distinguished original qualities or character will not be altered. Original shall mean at the time of initial construction or developed over the course of history of the structure.

Not applicable.

§14-12-8 (B) (5) Deteriorated architectural features should be repaired rather than replaced, if possible. If replacement is necessary, the new material shall match the original as closely as possible in like material and design.

Not applicable

§14-12-8 (B) (6) Additions to existing structures and new construction may be of contemporary design if such design is compatible with the historic zone in which it is to be located.

The glazing proposed for the existing roof dormers can be considered contemporary design and the development guidelines specify that contemporary design should not be discouraged if such design is compatible with the size, scale, color, material, and character of the neighborhood, buildings, or its environment. Staff concludes that the dormer treatment is compatible with the aforementioned.

§14-12-8 (B) (7) Demolition shall only be permitted if it is determined that the property is incapable of producing a reasonable economic return as presently controlled and that no means of preserving the structure has been found. In making a determination regarding reasonable economic return the Commission may consider the estimated market value of the building, land and any proposed replacement structures, financial details of the property including, but not limited to income and expense statements, current mortgage balances and appraisals, the length of time that the property has been on the market for sale or lease, potential return based on projected future market conditions, the building's structural condition, and other items determined to be relevant to the application.

Not applicable.

V. Neighborhood/Public Concerns

The application was legally advertised in the newspaper. Two signs were posted on the property with notice of the application.

The applicant notified the Historic Old Town Property Owners Association and the Sawmill Area Neighborhood Association and the Sawmill Community Land Trust of the request.

There is no known objection to this request.

Conclusions

This request for a Certificate of Appropriateness for alteration has been reviewed against the *Old Town Historic Zone and Buffer Zone Development Guidelines* and the criteria for approval of a Certificate of Appropriateness contained in the *LUC Ordinance*. The applicant's proposal to make alterations to the building is compatible with the development guidelines and is eligible for a Certificate of Appropriateness.

FINDINGS for APPROVAL of a request for a Certificate of Appropriateness for alteration - Case 12-LUCC-50046 / Project # 1002209 (November 14, 2012)

1. This application is a request for a Certificate of Appropriateness for alterations to the 2101 Mountain Road NW, described as Building E, Tract C of the Sheraton Old Town Inn Complex, MRGCD Map 38.
2. The subject building is a non-historic building in the northern New Mexico Vernacular style built circa XXXX. The building is located in the 300 foot “buffer” or transition zone surround the H-1 Historic Zone.
3. Section 14-16-2-25(E)(2) of the Comprehensive Zoning Code states “A Certificate of Appropriateness shall also be required for any construction, modification, addition, alteration, moving or destruction which would affect the exterior appearance of any structure or place with 300 feet of the H1 zone excluding public right-of-way.” Land zoned R-1 is excluded from this requirement. The subject property is zoned C-2, therefore the regulation applies. Procedures for a Certificate of Appropriateness shall be the same as those established by Chapter 14 Article 12, Landmarks and Urban Conservation, for HO Historic Overlay Zones, and the standards for architectural style and visual character in the H-1 Historic Zone.
4. The proposal is to make alterations to the exterior of the existing building that includes removal and replacement of the existing windows, removing infill that was inserted into window openings in a previous alteration. The existing gabled roof dormers will be converted to light wells by placing fixed glazing on all three sides. Other minor alteration include repair of wood posts and new fencing at a rear mechanical area.
5. Section 14-12-8(A) of the Landmarks and Urban Conservation Ordinance states that within the boundaries of a historic zone, the exterior appearance of any structure shall not be altered, new structures shall not be constructed, and existing structures shall not be demolished until a Certificate of Appropriateness has been duly approved.
6. The LUC Ordinance specifies that an application for a Certificate of Appropriateness shall be approved if it complies with several specified criteria. The LUC Ordinance Section 14-12(8)(B)(1) states that a Certificate of Appropriateness shall be approved if “*The change is consistent with the designation ordinance and specific development guidelines for the landmark or historic zone*”.
7. The proposed work is consistent with the development guidelines for the H-1 buffer zone. No historic buildings are affected. The removal of the window infill reverses an alteration

that is not particularly complimentary to the building or the district. The alterations are appropriate and will upgrade the appearance of the building while keeping the northern New Mexico Vernacular appearance. The installation of glazing on the existing roof dormers might be considered “contemporary” as referenced in Guidelines #8, however; the site is in buffer zone, where contemporary treatment is acceptable. The building should not be interpreted as an historic building.

8. The LUC Ordinance Section 14-12(8)(B)(2) states that a Certificate of Appropriateness shall be approved if “The architectural character, historical value, or archaeological value of the structure or site itself or of any historic zone or urban conservation overlay zone in which it is located will not be significantly impaired or diminished”.
9. The architectural character of the H-1 Historic Zone will not be impaired or diminished by the proposed alterations. The design maintains the New Mexico vernacular character of the building and compatible with the size, scale, color, material, and character of the neighborhood, buildings, or its environment.
10. The revised Code of Ordinances of Albuquerque New Mexico, 1994, including the Zoning Code, is incorporated herein by reference and made part of the record for all purposes.

RECOMMENDATION - Case No. 12-LUCC-50046/ Project # 1002209 – (November 14, 2012)

APPROVAL of an application for a Certificate of Appropriateness for alteration, located at 2101 Mountain Road NW, described as Building E, Tract C of the Sheraton Old Town Inn Complex, MRGCD Map 38 zoned C-2 based on the above 10 Findings.

Conditions of Approval Recommended for 12-LUCC-50046/ Project # 1002209

1. Applicant is responsible to acquire, and approval is contingent upon, approval of all applicable permits and related approvals.
-

**Maryellen Hennessy, Senior Planner,
Urban Design and Development Division**

Attachments

- 1) Excerpt from the Landmarks and Urban Conservation ordinance
- 2) Excerpt from §14-16-2-25
- 3) map of H-1 and 300 transition zone

CITY OF ALBUQUERQUE AGENCY COMMENTS

ZONING CODE SERVICES DIVISION

BUILDING & SAFETY SERVICES DIVISION

HISTORIC PRESERVATION/ADVANCED PLANNING

COMMENTS FROM OTHER AGENCIES, WHEN APPLICABLE:

PNM

ENVIRONMENTAL HEALTH DEPARTMENT

SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT DEPARTMENT

FIRE DEPARTMENT/Planning

TRANSIT DEPARTMENT

POLICE DEPARTMENT

PARKS AND GENERAL SERVICES

OPEN SPACE DIVISION

BERNALILLO COUNTY

ALBUQUERQUE FLOOD CONTROL AUTHORITY

ALBUQUERQUE PUBLIC SCHOOLS

MIDDLE RIO GRANDE COUNCIL OF GOVERNMENTS