



Agenda Number: 06 Case No.: 14-LUCC-50049 Project # 1004967 November 12, 2014

Staff Report

Agent	Bob McElheney, McElheney Architects	Staff Recommendation
Applicant	Old Town Plaza LLC	APPROVAL of Case # 14-LUCC-50049,
Request	Certificate of Appropriateness for alteration	Project #1004967, a request for a Certificate of Appropriateness for alteration based on the
Legal Description	Tract B Plat of the Lands of Casa de Armijo and Plaza Hacienda	Findings beginning on page 11 and subject to the Conditions of Approval on page 13.
Address/Location	302 and 304 San Felipe Street	
Size	2.17acres	
Zoning	H-1	Petra Morris, Senior Planner
Historic Location	Old Town Historic Zone	Staff Planner

Summary of Analysis

This request for a Certificate of Appropriateness for alteration has been reviewed against the Old Town Historic Zone Development Guidelines and the criteria for approval of a Certificate of Appropriateness contained in the LUC Ordinance. The proposed alterations conform to the development guidelines and are considered appropriate.

The subject building is classified as a contributing building in the Old Albuquerque Historic District, though the Pueblo Revival addition that wraps the building is not classified. The Italianate Mansion and its addition that constitute the Blueher House/ La Hacienda have seen a number of additions and alterations over the years.

The application affects two different parts of the building- the west elevation of the north addition and the east façade. On the west façade the proposal is to remove the storefront windows and door of an addition to the north of the building and replace them with double doors and build a larger brick landing platform/steps to access the larger opening safely. On the east façade the proposal is to remove an existing window and replace it with a new door, also replacing and expanding the concrete landing, stairs and railing that would serve the proposed new door and the existing door on the east façade.

All three elements of this request are aimed at improving access and use of the Blueher House/ La Hacienda building. The materials and approach proposed are appropriate and do not impair the form or integrity of the building.

PRIMARY REFERENCES:

Landmarks and Urban Conservation Ordinance; Design Guidelines for the Old Town Historic Zone.

Page 2

Development Review Division Report:

SUMMARY OF REQUEST

Requests	Certificate of Appropriateness for alteration
Historic Location	Old Town Historic Zone

AREA HISTORY AND CHARACTER

Surrounding architectural styles, historic character and recent (re)development

	# of Stories	Roof Configuration, Architectural Style and Approximate Age of Construction	Historic Classification & Land Use
General Area	1-2	Flat; Pitched (gabled and hipped), Carpenter Gothic, Spanish-Pueblo Revival and contemporary interpretations; Territorial Revival, Brick Commercial, 1796 – present.	Significant, Contributing, Unclassified Residential and Commercial
Site to the North	1	Pitched, New Mexico Vernacular 1890's - present	Contributing
Sites to the South	1	Flat, Territorial, Spanish Pueblo Revival. 1840's- present	Commercial; Significant
Sites to the East	1	Flat and Pitched, Pueblo Revival, New Mexico Vernacular, 1890's - present	Parking Lot, Commercial, Significant and Contributing
Site to the West	2	Pitched, Gothic, New Mexico Vernacular 1790s's- present	San Felipe de Neri Church; Significant

II INTRODUCTION

Proposal and History

This request is for a Certificate of Appropriateness to make alterations to the building known as the Blueher house, or the La Hacienda Restaurant. The proposed alterations affect the east and west elevations of the property. The east elevation is to the rear of the property and does not face San Felipe Street, it has little visibility from the Old Town Plaza area. The west elevation faces San Felipe Street and the Old Town Plaza area. On the west façade the proposal is to remove the storefront windows and door of an addition to the north of the building and replace them with double doors and build a larger brick landing platform/steps to access the larger opening safely. On the east façade the proposal is to re-open a second floor window opening and install a new window and on the ground floor level to remove an existing window and replace it with a new door, also replacing and expanding the concrete landing, stairs and railing that would serve the proposed new

door and the existing door on the east façade. The proposed alterations are intended to improve access and use of the property.

The subject site contains the Blueher house and farm buildings, a complex of buildings constructed between 1890 and 1908 that are associated with Herman Blueher. Blueher established a truck farm and nursery on the fields northeast of Old Town in 1896, in the area that now includes Tiguex Park. This application focuses on work on the Blueher House. The subject building is an Italianate mansion, built in 1898, but it was drastically altered in 1954, when it lost its original hipped roof and became encapsulated within Pueblo Revival style additions along the San Felipe Street frontage. A historic photo is attached that shows the brick mansion in 1898 (Attachment A). The evolution of the main building is illustrated on the attached Sanborn maps (Attachment B). The proposal affects the east façade, the only remaining original façade of the Blueher house visible and the west façade of a newer addition (1974) to the building.

The Blueher House, also known as the La Hacienda Restaurant is within the H1 zone and within the State Registered Historic District. It is somewhat unusual in that it is designated partially as a contributing property within the historic district- i.e. the portion of the structure that is the original house is contributing, while the additions that wrap the original house are not. The farm buildings that comprise the remainder of the complex of buildings on the site are designated contributing and significant, however there is no work proposed on them as a part of this request.

Over the years there have been a number of different requests for alterations and additions on the subject site, affecting either the Blueher house or the associated buildings. Most recently, in 2013 the LUCC approved a request to make alterations to enhance the appearance of the rear buildings, and to create more outdoor seating areas and connectivity on the east (or rear). Of relevance to this application, in August 1974, plans for a single story addition to the Blueher house were approved, as the Tewa Weavers Gallery (ARB-74-33), this application proposes to remove the storefront windows and door of this addition. In addition, in 1980 (LUC-80-21) a new door was approved for the east façade, the replacement wood door (but not the frame, transom or any other element of the door way) appears to be the only change to the ground floor east façade.

Context

The Historic Old Town Zone encompasses an area roughly between Mountain Road and Central Ave. on the north and south, and Rio Grande Blvd. and the 19th St. on the west and east. The historic zone was created with the adoption of the City's first zoning Code in 1959 to preserve and promote the educational, cultural and general welfare of the public through the preservation of protection of the traditional architectural character of historic old Albuquerque.

The Spanish Colonial, Territorial or Western Victorian architectural styles of buildings and structures erected prior to 1912 in the area now constituted as the State of New Mexico comprise the traditional architectural character of the H-1 Zone.

Inside of this historic zone is the state registered "Old Albuquerque Historic District". The Old Albuquerque Historic District is a sub-set of the Old Town Historic Zone. The historic district is the core of the Hispano village of Albuquerque, founded in 1706, and the main village in the area until the arrival of the railroad in 1880. The church and plaza are at the center of the district, as in most Hispanic villages of New Mexico.

Of the buildings in the district, only San Felipe de Neri church can be shown to date to the Spanish Colonial period. A few buildings may be in whole or in part from the early nineteenth century, but the majority of the buildings in Old Albuquerque Historic District were built between 1870 and 1900.

Almost every building has seen some degree of remodeling, resulting from the area's growth as a tourist-oriented commercial center after 1940. Old Albuquerque became "Old Town", a district of shops, boutiques, galleries and restaurants. Many buildings acquired Pueblo Revival portals, protruding false vigas and other stylistic elements thought to be conducive to a tourist atmosphere.

APPLICABLE PLANS, ORDINANCES, DESIGN GUIDELINES & POLICIES

III. ANALYSIS

Policies are written in regular text and staff analysis and comment in bold italic print.

Comprehensive Zoning Code

The Old Town Historic Zone was designated in 1959 with the adoption of the first Zoning Code for the City of Albuquerque. Old Town was recognized even then as a very special location within Albuquerque, and the H-1 Zone was designated specifically to address the development within Old Town. The H-1 Zone was later amended to include a 300 foot "buffer" zone surrounding Old Town to ensure a coherent visual character for the surrounding neighborhood. Signage, architectural style, and permissive uses are controlled through the H-1 Zoning. The code provides for Certificates of Appropriateness for development with the H-1 and the Buffer zones. Relevant sections of the H-1 Zone (§14-16-2-25, R.O.A., 1994) are attached.

Any construction, alteration or demolition, which would affect the exterior appearance of any structure within said Overlay Zone, shall not be undertaken until the Landmarks and Urban Conservation Commission has approved a Certificate of Appropriateness. The Code also provides that the adopted specific development guidelines may provide exemptions to the requirement or provide for City staff approval in lieu of Landmarks and Urban Conservation Commission approval. Procedures relating to the issuance of a Certificate of Appropriateness are prescribed in Chapter 14, Article 12, Landmarks and Urban Conservation.

An analysis of the proposal's conformance with the adopted specific development guidelines is provided below.

Development Guidelines for the Old Town Historic Zone

Design Guidelines (as amended through April 9, 1998) have been adopted by the Landmarks and Urban Conservation Commission for building projects in the H-1 Historic Old Town Zone. The Specific Design Guidelines for the Old Town Historic District also apply to the buffer zone within 300 feet of the historic district. The Guidelines are general, and along with standards applicable to the rehabilitation of historic properties, they address contemporary new buildings and pedestrian safety.

1. Every reasonable effort should be made to provide a compatible use for buildings which will require minimum alteration to the building and its environment.

2. Rehabilitation work should not destroy the distinguishing qualities or character of the property and its environment. The removal or alteration of any historic material or architectural features should be held to the minimum, consistent with the proposed use.

3. Deteriorated architectural features should be repaired rather than replaced, wherever possible. In the event replacement is necessary, the new material should match the material being replaced in composition, design, color, texture, and other visual qualities. Repair or replacement of missing

architectural features should be based on accurate duplications of original features, substantiated by physical or pictorial evidence rather than on conjectural designs of the availability of different architectural features from other buildings.

4. Distinctive stylistic features or examples of skilled craftsmanship which characterize older structure and often predate the mass production of building materials should be treated with sensitivity.

5. Many changes to buildings and environments which have taken place in the course of time are evidence of the history of the building and the neighborhood. These changes may have developed significance in their own right, and this significance should be recognized and respected.

6. All buildings should be recognized as products of their own time. Alterations to create an appearance inconsistent with the actual character of the building should be discouraged.

7. The design and general appearance of any development or alteration in the Old Town Historic Zone should be limited to the range of design options possible and commonly chosen in Albuquerque prior to the opening of the Santa Fe Railroad in April 1880. The design of any alteration to currently existing structures erected between 1880 and 1912 should be limited to the range of design options possible and commonly chosen at the time of the building's construction.

8. Contemporary design for new buildings and additions to existing buildings or landscaping in the 300 foot transition zone surrounding the Old Town Historic Zone should not be discouraged if such design is compatible with the size, scale, color, material, and character of the neighborhood, buildings, or its environment.

9. Wherever possible, new additions or alterations to buildings should be done in such a manner that if they were to be removed in the future, the essential form and integrity of the original building would be unimpaired.

10. Every effort should be made to safeguard the public welfare along vehicular and pedestrian traffic ways. Placement of walls, building projections, fences, planters, shrubs, signs, ramps, steps, etc. should be planned and positioned so that they do not present a potential hazard. Provisions for the handicapped should be planned so that the essential character of the property is not damaged.

11. Any security device that prevents major features of doors and windows such as ornament, panels, glass panes, and mullions from being seen are prohibited.

12. Property owners are considering installing security devices are urged to contact LUCC staff for advice and a free handout on how to increase security without detracting from the historic character of a building.

13. An application for a Certificate of Appropriateness for work, which does not require any type of building or construction permit, may be approved by staff.

The proposed alterations are broken down into the components for analysis purposes.

1) Remove the storefront windows and door on the west elevation of the north addition to the subject building. Replace with wood double doors with 12 glass panes and bottom panel. Enlarge the front step to address the wider opening.

This addition to the north edge of the Blueher House/ La Hacienda was built in 1974, as the Tewa Weavers Gallery, it is a long, narrow building that is one story in height, with a brick territorial style trim to the parapet. The building, while in keeping with the character of Old Town, is not historic. The building/addition reads as an extension to the larger Pueblo Revival structure that wraps the older Italianate mansion. The doors proposed are appropriate and compatible with the scale of the building and the character of the area. The doors are wood, with 12 glass panes and fixed bottom panel. This proposal does not conflict with the Development Guidelines for the Old Town Historic Zone. Removing the storefront windows and door, and replacing it with double doors will facilitate the use of the space and will not detract from the architectural character of the building or the wider area on this prominent façade, facing the Old Town Plaza area.

2) On the east façade, restore a window to the 2^{nd} Floor window opening that is currently closed. The new wood window will be double hung to match those on the house and will be the same dimension as the existing opening, using the existing cast stone lintel and sill.

The subject window was filled in at some point in time. However, the space where the window was located is still visible under the stucco, as are the cast stone lintel and sill. The proposal to restore the window to the opening, at the same dimension and configuration (double hung) is rehabilitation work that the guidelines strongly supports and encourages. The double hung wood frame window is an appropriate choice and fits with the existing windows. The proposal furthers the Design Guidelines for the Old Town Historic Zone.

3) On the east façade, remove the existing middle, ground floor window and replace it with a door, transom and new lintel to match the existing. The lintel must be replaced as the opening will be larger than the existing window opening. The concrete landing, steps and railing will be enlarged to accommodate the existing door and the proposed door.

The east façade is the only remaining façade of the original Blueher House that remains visible. The Blueher House has experienced a number of changes over the years. The proposal to replace the existing window with a door does change the type of openings on the east façade, however the pattern and scale are not changed significantly, as the opening will be enlarged but not to a significant degree. The door, transom and cast stone lintel are proposed to match the existing door on the east façade, and these details match those of the other openings on the east façade. The alteration proposed could be removed at some point in the future. The proposal addresses a façade that faces to the rear, a parking area and it does not impair the form or integrity of the building. The proposed alteration is designed to provide more use of and access to the interior, original portion of the Blueher House, currently used mainly for storage, due to access limitations and challenges. The enlarged

landing, steps and railing area design and scale are appropriate. The proposal to replace the window with a door does not significantly conflict with the Design Guidelines for the Old Town Historic Zone.

Landmarks and Urban Conservation Ordinance

This site consists of a contributing property in the Old Town Historic Zone and the project is subject to certain provisions of the <u>Landmarks and Urban Conservation Ordinance</u> (Article 12, R.O.A., 1994). The purpose of this ordinance is to:

"Preserve, protect, enhance, perpetuate and promote the use of structures and areas of historical, cultural, architectural, engineering, archeological or geographic significance located in the city; to strengthen the city's economic base by stimulating the tourist industry; to enhance the identity of the city by protecting the city's heritage and prohibiting the unnecessary destruction or defacement of its cultural assets; and to conserve existing urban developments as viable economic and social entities."

Section 14-12-8 (A) of the LUC ordinance provides that:

"Within the boundaries of a historic zone, urban conservation overlay zone, or landmark site, the exterior appearance of any structure shall not be altered, new structures shall not be constructed, and existing structures shall not be demolished until a Certificate of Appropriateness has been duly approved."

Section 14-12-8 (A) of the LUC ordinance provides criteria for approval of a Certificate of Appropriateness:

\$14-12-8-B- (1) The change is consistent with the designation ordinance and specific development guidelines for the historic overlay zone.

As discussed in the analysis above, the proposed alterations do not significantly conflict with the designation ordinance or the development guidelines.

§14-12-8 (B) (2) The architectural character, historical value, or archaeological value of the structure or site itself or of any historic zone in which it is located will not be significantly impaired or diminished.

The architectural character of the site or the historic zone will not be significantly impaired or diminished by the proposed alterations as analyzed above.

§14-12-8 (B) (3) The change qualified as a "certified rehabilitation: pursuant to the Tax Reform Act of 1976.

Not applicable.

§14-12-8 (B) (4) The structure or site's distinguished original qualities or character will not be altered. Original shall mean at the time of initial construction or developed over the course of history of the structure.

The Blueher House has experienced a large number of alterations over the years, including but not limited to the removal of the hipped roof, and the enclosure of three sides of the structure with a Pueblo Revival addition. This application contains three separate components. The proposal to replace the storefront windows and door does not affect an original part of the structure, but rather an addition/building that dates to 1974. The proposal to restore a window to the opening on the 2nd floor of the east façade is appropriate restoration work. However the proposal to replace a window on the east façade kith a door requires the alteration of an original feature, and is more complex. The east façade faces the rear, away from the Old Town Plaza area. The scale, design, and the addition of a transom and a new cast stone lintel to match the existing ensure that while the alteration will change the type of openings on this elevation, the pattern of openings will not be changed significantly, or in such a way that the work could not be reversed on the future. The window proposed for conversion is not a distinguished feature and the proposal will not change the structure's overall character.

\$14-12-8 (B) (5) Deteriorated architectural features should be repaired rather than replaced, if possible. If replacement is necessary, the new material shall match the original as closely as possible in like material and design.

Not applicable

\$14-12-8 (B) (6) Additions to existing structure and new construction may be of contemporary design if such design is compatible with the historic zone in which it is to be located.

Not applicable.

§14-12-8 (B) (7) Demolition shall only be permitted if it is determined that the property is incapable of producing a reasonable economic return as presently controlled and that no means of preserving the structure has been found. In making a determination regarding reasonable economic return the Commission may consider the estimated market value of the building, land and any proposed replacement structures, financial details of the property including, but not limited to income and expense statements, current mortgage balances and appraisals, the length of time that the property has been on the market for sale or lease, potential return based on projected future market conditions, the building's structural condition, and other items determined to be relevant to the application.

Not applicable.

V. Neighborhood/Public Concerns

The application was legally advertised in the newspaper. Two signs were posted on the property was posted with notice of the application, one of the San Felipe frontage and one on the rear façade.

The Office of Neighborhood Coordination stated that there were no neighborhood and/or homeowner associations in the area to notify.

Staff has received no comments from the public.

Conclusions

This request for a Certificate of Appropriateness for alteration has been reviewed against the *Old Town Historic Zone Development Guidelines* and the criteria for approval of a Certificate of Appropriateness contained in the *LUC Ordinance*. The proposed alterations conform to the development guidelines and are considered appropriate.

The subject building is classified as a contributing building in the Old Albuquerque Historic District, though the Pueblo Revival addition that wraps the building is not classified. The Italianate Mansion and its addition that constitute the Blueher House/ La Hacienda have seen a number of additions and alterations over the years. The use of the building has evolved over the years from residential to a restaurant, shops and supporting office and storage spaces. Despite all of the alterations over the years the building still conveys some of its historic significance.

The application affects two different parts of the building- the west elevation of the north addition and the east façade. As discussed in the analysis above, proposed replacement of the storefront windows and door with a set of double doors on the north addition affect a non-historic portion of the building (1974 construction), the proposed double doors are consistent with the applicable guidelines. Again, as discussed above, the east façade is the only remaining visible elevation of the original Blueher House. The proposal to reopen the 2nd floor window is restoration work that the guidelines support and encourage, and the window choice proposed is appropriate. The replacement of the ground floor middle window with a door, while changing the type of opening on façade, does not change the pattern of opening, or the general scale of the opening as the door would not be significantly larger than the existing window and the use of a transom and cast stone lintel would replicate the patterns that exist on the façade. The proposed enlarging of the landing, stairs and railing are appropriate.

All three elements of this request are aimed at improving access and use of the Blueher House/ La Hacienda building. The materials and approach proposed are appropriate and do not impair the form or integrity of the building.

FINDINGS for APPROVAL of a request for a Certificate of Appropriateness for alteration - Case 14-LUCC-50049 / Project # 1004967 (November 12, 2014)

- 1. This application is a request for a Certificate of Appropriateness for alterations to the building known as the Blueher House, or La Hacienda, described as Tract B, Lands of Casa de Armijo and Plaza Hacienda, MRGCD Map 38, in the Historic Old Town (H-1) Zone.
- 2. Section 14-16-2-25(D)(1) of the Comprehensive Zoning Code states "Any construction, modification, addition, alteration, moving or destruction which would affect the exterior appearance of any structure or place in the H-1 zone requires a Certificate of Appropriateness which must be approved by the Landmarks and Urban Conservation Commission."
- 3. The subject building is the historic Blueher House building. The State Register nomination notes the building as an Italianate Mansion with Pueblo Revival additions. The building was built in 1898 and remodeled in 1954. The building is contributing to the Old Albuquerque Historic District.
- 4. The application affects two different parts of the building- the west elevation of the north addition and the east façade. On the west façade, remove the storefront windows and door of an addition to the north of the building and replace them with double doors and build a larger brick landing platform/steps to access the larger opening safely. On the east façade, re-open a second floor window opening and install a new window and on the ground floor level to remove an existing window and replace it with a new door, also replacing and expanding the concrete landing, stairs and railing that would serve the proposed new door and the existing door on the east façade.
- 5. Section 14-12-8(A) of the Landmarks and Urban Conservation Ordinance states that within the boundaries of a historic zone, the exterior appearance of any structure shall not be altered, new structures shall not be constructed, and existing structures shall not be demolished until a Certificate of Appropriateness has been duly approved.
- 6. The LUC Ordinance specifies that an application for a Certificate of Appropriateness shall be approved if it complies with several specified criteria. The LUC Ordinance Section 14-12(8)(B)(1) states that a Certificate of Appropriateness shall be approved if "*The change is consistent with the designation ordinance and specific development guidelines for the landmark or historic zone*".

- 7. Removal of the storefront windows and doors on the west elevation of the north addition, built in 1974 as the Tewa Weavers Gallery, impact a part of the building that is not historic. The replacement doors are appropriate and compatible with the scale of the building and the character of the area. The doors are wood, with 12 glass panes and fixed bottom panel. This proposal does not conflict with the Development Guidelines for the Old Town Historic Zone. Removing the storefront windows and door, and replacing it with double doors will facilitate the use of the space and will not detract from the architectural character of the building or the wider area on this prominent façade, facing the Old Town Plaza area.
- 8. Restoring the second floor window on the east façade to its original opening, at the same dimension and configuration, using the existing cast stone lintel and sill is rehabilitation work that the guidelines strongly supports and encourages. The double hung wood frame window is an appropriate choice and fits with the existing windows. The proposal furthers the Design Guidelines for the Old Town Historic Zone.
- 9. Removal of the middle ground floor window on the east façade and replacement with a door, transom and new cast stone lintel to match does change the type of openings on the east façade, however the pattern and scale are not changed significantly, as the opening will be enlarged but not to a significant degree. The door, transom and cast stone lintel will match the details of the other openings on the east façade. The alteration proposed could be removed at some point in the future. The proposal addresses a façade that faces to the rear, a parking area and it does not impair the form or integrity of the building. The enlarged landing, steps and railing area design and scale are appropriate. The proposal to replace the window with a door does not significantly conflict with the Design Guidelines for the Old Town Historic Zone.
- 10. The LUC Ordinance Section 14-12(8)(B)(2) states that a Certificate of Appropriateness shall be approved if "The architectural character, historical value, or archaeological value of the structure or site itself or of any historic zone or urban conservation overlay zone in which it is located will not be significantly impaired or diminished".
- 11. The architectural character of the H-1 Historic Zone will not be impaired or diminished by the proposed alterations. The three elements of this request are aimed at improving access and use of the Blueher House/ La Hacienda building. The materials and approach proposed are appropriate and do not impair the form or integrity of the building.

12. The revised Code of Ordinances of Albuquerque New Mexico, 1994, including the Zoning Code, is incorporated herein by reference and made part of the record for all purposes.

RECOMMENDATION - Case No. 14-LUCC-50049/ Project # 1004967 – (November 12, 2014)

APPROVAL of an application for a Certificate of Appropriateness for alteration, to the Blueher House and its additions, described as Tract B of the Lands of Casa de Armijo and Plaza Hacienda, MRGCD Map 38, zoned H-1 based on the above twelve Findings and subject to the following condition.

Conditions of Approval Recommended for 14-LUCC-50049/ Project # 1004967

1. Applicant is responsible to acquire, and approval is contingent upon, approval of all applicable permits and related approvals.

Petra Morris, Senior Planner, Urban Design and Development Division

Attachments

A) Photo of the Blueher House

- B) Sanborn Maps from 1942 and 1957
- C) Site visit photos

D) Excerpt from the Landmarks and Urban Conservation ordinance.

Page 14

CITY OF ALBUQUERQUE AGENCY COMMENTS

ZONING CODE SERVICES DIVISION BUILDING & SAFETY SERVICES DIVISION HISTORIC PRESERVATION/ADVANCED PLANNING

COMMENTS FROM OTHER AGENCIES, WHEN APPLICABLE: PNM ENVIRONMENTAL HEALTH DEPARTMENT SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT DEPARTMENT FIRE DEPARTMENT/Planning TRANSIT DEPARTMENT POLICE DEPARTMENT PARKS AND GENERAL SERVICES OPEN SPACE DIVISION BERNALILLO COUNTY ALBUQUERQUE FLOOD CONTROL AUTHORITY ALBUQUERQUE PUBLIC SCHOOLS MIDDLE RIO GRANDE COUNCIL OF GOVERNMENTS