

City of Albuquerque

Citizens' Independent Salary Commission P.O. BOX 1293, ALBUQUERQUE, NM 87103

Interoffice Memorandum

March 29, 2023

TO: Ethan D. Watson, City Clerk

FROM: Dr. Kent A. Hickman, Chairman, Citizens' Independent Salary Commission

RE: Salaries for the Mayor and Councilors

City of Albuquerque voters approved the Citizens Independent Salary Commission (Commission) as an amendment to the City Charter (Article XVIII) in the election of October 6, 2009. The Commission is authorized to establish the salary structures of the Mayor and City Councilors. The Commission evaluates the annual salaries in accordance with salary and benefit data and determines if an increase or decrease to salaries is warranted.

Current and prior Commission review processes include, studying the roles and responsibilities of the Mayor and City Councilors, collecting and analyzing salary and benefit data of like-sized municipalities, collecting input on an interactive website and survey, and consideration of past salary increases. Information from all the processes above contributed to the Commission's decision.

The decision of the Commission is the benefits of the Mayor and City Councilors will remain the same. The salary of the Mayor and City Councilors will both receive an increase.

Mayor salary – from \$132,500.00 to \$146,081.00 City Councilors salary – from \$33,660.00 to \$62,843.00 Council President salary – from \$35,860.00 to \$66,927.80

The Commission thanks the Mayor and City Councilors for their dedicated service to the City of Albuquerque and its citizens.

The complete report is available at www.cabq.gov/audit/citizens-independent-salary-commission. If you have additional questions contact: Dr. Kent A. Hickman, Chairman, (505) 768-3150 or khickman.audcisc@cabq.gov.



Citizens' Independent Salary Commission *City of Albuquerque*

P.O. BOX 1293 ALBUQUERQUE, NEW MEXICO

Final Memorandum

March 29, 2023

TO: Ethan Watson, City Clerk

FROM: Kent Hickman, Chairman, Citizens' Independent Salary Commission

SUBJECT: Evaluations of the Salaries for the Mayor and City Councilors

Executive Summary

City of Albuquerque voters approved the Citizens' Independent Salary Commission (Commission) as an amendment to the City Charter (Article XVIII) in the election of October 6, 2009. At least one year prior to each regular municipal election, the Commission is tasked with studying, evaluating, and (if warranted) recommending specific changes to the compensation levels of the Mayor and City Councilors. Should the Commission determine that the salary should be increased or decreased, the Commission shall file a written salary schedule with the City Clerk indicating the proposed salary. Any changes to salaries shall not be effective for the incumbent Mayor or Councilors but shall be effective at the beginning of the next term.

The Commission considered a variety of data, including historical compensation received by the Mayor and City Councilors, comparative pay and forms of government among similar cities, the managerial complexity of elected officials' labor, as well as changes in cost of living and median household income. Information from these analyses contributed to the Commission's decision. This is the seventh review conducted by the Commission since its inception.¹

The decision of the Commission is that the salary of the Mayor and City Councilors will be:

Mayor salary – from \$132,500.00 to \$146,081.00 City Councilors salary – from \$33,660.00 to \$62,843.00 Council President salary – from \$35,860.00 to \$66,928.00

¹ The Commission's first evaluation of salaries report was issued on February 26, 2013. Source: Citizens' Independent Salary Commission, "Citizens' Independent Salary Commission Report and Recommendations," <<u>https://www.cabq.gov/audit/documents/2013_02_26_10_34_36.pdf</u>>, accessed February 22, 2023.

The Commission thanks the Mayor and City Councilors for their dedicated service to the City of Albuquerque and its citizens. We appreciate that the Commission's independence was respected by their neither seeking to influence nor directing our deliberations in any way. The complete report is available at https://www.cabq.gov/audit/citizens-independent-salary-commission. If you have additional questions, contact Dr. Kent Hickman, Chairman, at (505) 768-3150.

Commission Charter Amendment

Through the charter amendment, the Commission was given the authority to evaluate the annual salaries of the Mayor and Councilors and determine whether they should be increased or decreased. The Commission has the authority to consider all factors relevant to the salaries. Parameters given to the Commission are as follows in Article XVIII of the Charter:

- (a) The Commission shall consist of five members selected by the Accountability in Government Oversight Committee (AGO). All members shall be residents of the City of Albuquerque and shall not be an officer, official or employee of the city or an immediate family member of the same. The term of each member shall be for four years, unless a member is selected to fill a vacancy, and no member shall be appointed to more than two terms. The initial terms of members of the newly established Commission shall be staggered; the initial term for two members shall be two years and the initial term of three members shall be four years.
- (b) At least one year prior to each regular municipal election, the Commission shall review the salaries paid by the city to the Mayor and Councilors. If after such review the Commission determines that the salary should be increased or decreased, the Commission shall file a written salary schedule with the City Clerk indicating the proposed salary.
- (c) Changes to the salaries shall not be effective for the incumbent Mayor and Councilors, but shall be effective at the beginning of the next term.
- (d) Any change to salaries recommended by the Commission shall be subject to the referendum procedures as provided for in Article III, Section 2 of the Charter.
- (e) All meetings of the Commission shall be open to the public and subject to the Open Meetings Act, Sections 10-15-1 et seq. NMSA 1978.

Commission Members

As specified in City Charter (see excerpt above), the Commission was selected through a process administered by AGO. Commissioners have no ties or conflicts with the City of Albuquerque, the Mayor, or City Council. AGO appointed the following individuals to serve on the Commission:

Name	Term End Date
Dr. Kent Hickman, Chairman	2025
Kari Sutton, Vice-Chair	2026
Molly Rogers	2026
Michael Garlid	2026
Vacant	

Methodology

The Commission approached its work with consideration to research with the utmost transparency and remained steadfast in its mission to look at the positions and not the individuals who currently hold them. The members of the Commission produced this report with the assistance of the exceptional staff within the City's Office of Internal Audit. Methodologies used to conduct this analysis included but are not limited to the following:

- Studied the roles and responsibilities of the City's Mayor and City Councilors.
- Sought input from the Mayor and City Councilors on the estimated hours committed to their duties.
- Sought input from the public, Mayor, City Councilors, Chief Administrative Officer, and Council Services Director regarding the salaries established for elected officials.
- Analyzed historical salaries for the City's Mayor and City Councilors since 2013.
- Assessed changes in the cost of living and affordability based on the Consumer Price Index (CPI) and the median household income.
- Researched and analyzed comparable cities based on factors such as city budget, full-time employees, population size, government structure, and median income, to identify and compare the level of responsibility for elected officials versus their salaries and overall compensation.
- Analyzed the hours reported as worked, salaries, and total compensation packages (where feasible) earned by Albuquerque elected officials, as well as their respective roles and responsibilities.
- Assessed the feasibility of changes to salaries based on the City of Albuquerque's current and forecasted budgets.

- Discussed the results of information received, as a group, in compliance with Open Meetings Act which were open to public comment.
- Considered the facts presented in prior Commission reports and the recommendations included in them.

Albuquerque Government Structure

The City of Albuquerque utilizes a mayor-council system. In this form of municipal government, the city council serves as the city's primary legislative body while the mayor serves as the city's chief executive. Mayor-council governments generally feature an elected executive officer called a mayor and an elected legislative body that is most often known as the city council.

The mayor-council government is one of the five major types of municipal government utilized throughout the United States. The other four are council-manager, commission, open town meetings, and representative town meetings.

In a council-manager government, an elected city council serves as the city's primary legislative body and appoints a chief executive officer called a city manager to oversee day-to-day municipal operations, draft a budget, and implement and enforce the council's policy and legislation initiatives. In most council-manager systems, an elected mayor serves on the city council as a regular voting member with little or no legal privileges that may distinguish the position from the other members of council.

A city commission is a form of municipal government in which individually elected officials serve on a small governing board called a commission. The commission exercises both legislative and executive powers to govern the municipality. Usually, commission members are elected on an at-large basis, rather than from wards or districts.

An open town meeting government is a form of municipal government in which all qualified voters of the municipality have an opportunity to assemble on a given day to debate and vote on policy decisions. A representative town meeting government is a form of municipal government that is similar to the open town meeting structure because legislative policies for the town are debated and set at an assembly of residents. However, in this form the residents of the town elect a large number of citizens, called town meeting members, to represent them at the town meeting.

Below is the City of Albuquerque's organizational chart as detailed on page 6 of the City's 2023 approved budget.²



Duties of the Mayor and City Council

According to the City's Charter, "The Mayor shall be the Chief Executive Officer with all executive and administrative powers of the City and shall devote full time and attention to the performance of the duties of the office and shall hold no other paid public or private employment" (Article V, section 3). The Mayor is also the official head of the city for all ceremonial purposes, representing the City on state, national, and international levels. The duties of the Mayor (Article V, section 4) include, among other things, organizing the

² City of Albuquerque, "Approved Budget Fiscal Year 2023," <<u>https://www.cabq.gov/dfa/documents/fy23-approved-budget-final-sept-13.pdf</u>>, accessed February 22, 2023.

executive branch of the City, exercising administrative control, supervising over and appointing directors of city departments, administrating and protecting the merit system, formulating city budgets. Furthermore, with the advice and consent of City Council, the Mayor is responsible for appointing the Chief Administrative Officer; any deputy administrative officers; the Chief of Police; the Fire Chief; and members of city committees, commissions, and boards. The Mayor is also head of the Mayor's Office, which supports the elected chief executive and ceremonial head of the City pursuant to the City Charter. The office is comprised of eight support staff and constituent services. The Mayor is paid a salary of \$132,500 and is eligible for employee benefits including health, dental, vision, and life insurance.

The Chief Administrative Office Department supports the Mayor, as well as general city functions. The Chief Administrative Officer (CAO) is appointed by the Mayor with the consent of the City Council to provide day-to-day management of the City. Together, the Mayor and CAO provide the leadership and direction to execute policies legislated by the City Council. The CAO is currently paid a salary of \$220,522 and is eligible for employee benefits.

According to the Charter's Historical Postscripts, as a result of a special election held on February 26, 1974, the five-member City Commission (which had governed the City of Albuquerque since 1917) was replaced with a full-time Mayor as the City's chief executive and a nine-member, part-time, districted City Council as the legislative arm of city government. As codified by City Charter (Article IV, section 4), "The terms of the office of a Councilor, unless sooner recalled or removed, shall begin on January 1 following the candidate's election and be four years or until a successor is duly elected and qualified. The councilors may succeed themselves in office. The terms of office of Councilors shall be staggered with four or five districted Councilors elected every two years." Members are paid a salary and are eligible for employee benefits including health, dental, vision, and life insurance.

According to the Charter (Article IV, section 8), the City Council has "the power to adopt all ordinances, resolutions or other legislation conducive to the welfare of the people of the City." The duties of the City Council (Article IV, section 10) include, among other things, establishing and adopting five-year goals and one-year objectives for the City (these goals and objectives are to be reviewed and revised annually by City Council); reviewing, approving, or amending all city budgets; adopting policies, plans, programs, and legislation consistent with the goals and objectives established by City Council; and hiring personnel necessary to enable City Council to adequately perform its duties.

Council Services provides support services to the City Council. The Council Services Director is responsible for oversight of the office and advising City Councilors on City

affairs. In fiscal year 2023, the approved budget for Council Services was \$6.3 million and comprised of 35 full-time budgeted positions, including one full-time staff member (a Council Policy Analyst position) that provides professional staff assistance to an assigned City Councilor. The Council Services Director is currently paid a salary of \$170,165 and is eligible for employee benefits.

The City Council President is elected in a vote of all City Council members and has numerous unique responsibilities. The City Council President is responsible for preserving order and decorum; directing City Council meetings; assigning bills; preparing and disseminating meeting agendas with public notice for the meeting; appointing all Committees whether standing, joint, or special, subject to the approval of the City Council except where otherwise indicated; and designating the Chairperson of each Committee subject to the approval of the City Council with the exception of Chair of the Committeeof-the-Whole. The City Council President is currently paid a salary of \$35,860 and like all City Councilors, is eligible for employee benefits.

In addition to the duties outlined by the Charter, City Council members also participate in a variety of committees. The table below details the various committees and the number of City Council members appointed to each committee for 2023.³

Committee Branch	Committee Name	Number of Appointed Council Members
	Committee-of-the Whole Budget	9
Standing	Finance and Government Operations	5
Committee	Land Use, Planning & Zoning Committee	5
	Public Safety Committee	5
	Albuquerque/Bernalillo County Government Commission	4
Governing Bodies	Albuquerque-Bernalillo Water Utility Authority	3
with Council	Mid-Region Council of Governments	6
Participation	Regional Transit District	5

City Council Committees - 2023

³ City of Albuquerque, "City Council Home-Committees," <<u>https://www.cabq.gov/council/committees>, accessed</u> February 8, 2023.

Committee Branch	Committee Name	Number of Appointed Council Members
Committees on	Accountability in Government Oversight Committee	1
which Councilors	Alvarado Transportation Center Project Task Force	1
and the Administration	Committee on Guidelines for Negotiations	3
Serve to Govern	Intergovernmental Legislative Relations	3
the City	Economic Development Action Account	2
Committees for Internal Council Matters	Internal Operations Committee	9
	Visit Albuquerque	3
Non-City	Community Schools	2
Committees that Include Council	Explora	2
Participation	Hispano Chamber of Commerce	2
•	New Mexico Municipal League Representative	2

Mayor Survey Results

A 15-question survey was administered electronically to the Mayor. The questions primarily centered around whether the position's responsibilities have changed, how many hours are needed to fulfill the position's duties, and whether the established salaries for elected officials affect those that would like to run for office. The table below details the Mayor's unedited responses.

Mayor Survey Responses

Question	Generalized Response
Question #1: In your opinion, what are the essential duties of the Mayor-elect?	The Mayor is the 'CEO' of City government, responsible for all executive functions of the City from personnel, to expenditure of funds, to strategy and goal setting. The Mayor also has very real 'public leadership' expectations, which range from representing the City in state,

	federal and sometimes international venues; with community groups, neighborhoods and residents of Albuquerque; and in times of public crises, like the pandemic.
Question #2: In your opinion, what is the minimum number of hours a week the position of Mayor-elect should be able to dedicate to adequately fulfill the responsibilities of the position?	The minimum hours necessary is correlated to both the official duties, public expectations, and personal leadership disposition of a Mayor. In our city, the Mayor has always been held to a very high standard and has been essentially accountable for everything, regardless if it's a City issue or an issue that can be changed. Residents and media alike demand the Mayor have answers. The last five Mayors, who I know personally, worked a minimum of 55 hours. For these reasons, I think the minimum is 55 hours a week, although most Mayors work 70+ hours a week.
Question: #3: Approximately how many hours each work week do you spend attending and preparing for meetings and functions that are official City-sponsored activities?	On average, this accounts for almost half of the Mayor's time. For me, given an average of 70 hours per week, this would be about 35 hours a week.
Question #4: Approximately how many hours each work week do you spend attending and preparing for meetings and functions that are <u>not</u> official City-sponsored activities? Please provide some examples of these types of meetings and functions.	On average, this accounts for almost half of the Mayor's time. For me, given an average of 70 hours per week, this would be about 35 hours a week.
Question #5: In your opinion, have the responsibilities required of the Mayor-elect position expanded, contracted, or remained	The role and responsibilities continue to expand. One reason is that the size and scope of city government continues to increase. Three new departments have

unchanged over the years, and if so, in what ways?	been added in the last five years, including a third emergency response department, Albuquerque Community Safety (ACS). This inevitably increases the demands on the Mayor's 'CEO' portion of the job. While not new, the public expectations continue to be high. Mayor has always been held to a very high standard, essentially accountable for most issues, regardless if it's a local problem or not.
Question #6: Are there issues you want to pursue as Mayor-elect, but cannot due to time and/or resource constraints? If so, please explain.	Ability to take on projects is really a function of budget and the ability to recruit, retain and fund strong department directors and Mayor's office executives. If I had funding and candidates for two more deputy CAOs, we could pursue additional projects. In terms of public safety, every single police officer, firefighter and community safety responder we can recruit or retain enables our City to 'do more'.
Question #7: In your opinion, how does the salary established for the position of Mayor- elect impact an individual's decision to run for office? If so, in what ways?	The salary plays a role, but it is only a contributing factor. Albuquerque is fortunate to have had a full-time, appropriately compensated Mayor for decades, so in general pay is not a problem. However, as 'CEO' of the City, the Mayor makes much less than dozens of others at the City. This creates distortion both in wages and recruitment. For example, why would someone be Mayor if they could be CAO, which pays almost double? Just something to consider.

Question #8: In your opinion, does the salary established for the Mayor present any economic barriers to potential candidates considering running for office? If so, in what way?	Not in reality, but perhaps in perception when the position is compared to a department director or city manager.
Question #9: In your opinion, do you feel that the established salary for the position of Mayor-elect is sufficient to not require additional sources of income?	Yes
Question #10: As Mayor-elect, do you receive any other forms of compensation, such as investment, retirement, or outside employment?	No, but we do have a dual-income household, as my wife works full-time.
Question #11: In your opinion, are the salaries established for the position of elected City Councilors reflective of their responsibilities and the time necessary to perform them?	Yes
Question #12: In your opinion, would the citizens of Albuquerque benefit from their elected City Councilors being able to dedicate full-time attention to their roles?	Declined to respond.
Question #13: In your opinion, do the salaries established for the positions of elected City Councilors impact an individual's decision to run for office? If so, in what ways?	Declined to respond.

Question #14: In your opinion, do the salaries established for positions of elected City Councilors present any economic barriers to potential candidates considering running for office? If so, in what way?	Declined to respond.
Question #15: Please list any additional comments you may have.	In general, the City has been trying to adjust all wages to keep up with inflation, especially in the last few years. This should be considered by the panel.

City Council Survey Results

A 15-question survey was administered electronically to the City Councilors. The questions primarily centered around whether the positions' responsibilities have changed, how many hours are needed to fulfill their duties, and whether the established salaries for elected officials affect those that would like to run for office. The table below details the City Councilors' generalized responses.

City Council Survey Results

Question	Number of Responses Received	Generalized Responses
Question #1: In your opinion, what are the essential duties of an elected City Councilor?	5	Represent the constituents and respond to their concerns; strengthen the representation of the community; collaborate with Councilors; effect change in the community by addressing both district and citywide issues; hold the Administration accountable; budget oversight; study public policy and city issues

Quartian #2:		
Question #2: In your opinion, what is the minimum number of hours a week an elected City Councilor should be able to dedicate to adequately fulfill the responsibilities of the position?	6	RangeAverage10-40+ Hours28 HoursMedian28
Question: #3: Approximately how many hours each work week do you spend attending and preparing for meetings and functions that are official City-sponsored activities?	6	Range Average 8-40 Hours 29 Hours Median 28
Question #4: Approximately how many hours each work week do you spend attending and preparing for meetings and functions that are not official City-sponsored activities? Please provide some examples of these types of meetings and functions.	6	Range 0 – 20 hours Median 20 Meetings with local business owners, citizens, and community- based organizations; neighborhood associations, community meetings and events.
Question #5: In your opinion, have the responsibilities required of the position of elected City Councilors expanded, contracted, or remained unchanged over the years?	6	All six responses agree that the responsibilities have expanded and that the position required full-time attention. Some sited more legislation is passed annually; the budget is more expansive; more collaborative projects; size of districts and constituents have increased.
Question #6: Are there issues you want to pursue as an elected City Councilor, but cannot due to time and/or resource constraints? If so, please explain.	4	Yes, constituent services, legislation development; additional time dedicated to research and analysis of issues; difficult to gain long-term traction on complex issues without being able to dedicate full-time attention; no, time is not the constraint.

Question #7: In your opinion, how does the salary established for the position of elected City Councilors impact an individual's decision to run for office?	6	Very difficult for a person with at full-time job to hold the position; the decision to run should not depend on salary; only those with flexible day jobs can afford to run for this office; higher pay would make it easier for Councilors to prioritize their role above outside employment; the salary is critical for working families; paying a living wage would make it easier for working age councilors to prioritize city responsibilities; the salary does not impact the decision; pay should be higher so that anyone can afford to run for office; deters qualified candidates.
Question #8: In your opinion, do the salaries established for the positions of elected City Councilors present any economic barriers to potential candidates considering running for office? If so, in what way?	6	The salary and benefits could influence potential candidates; being a Councilor is a full-time job that only pays 1/3 salary; for working families, it is challenging to find a flexible job that accommodates the demands of a Councilor; not to their knowledge; it does not present any economic barriers; pay should be higher so that anyone can afford to run for office; prevents many from running as it interferes with other employment.
Question #9: In your opinion, would the citizens of Albuquerque benefit from their elected City Councilors being able to dedicate full-time attention to their roles?	5	The citizens would absolutely benefit; currently, the duties do not warrant full-time hours, but this may change in near future; if full-time attention is needed to address critical issues, Councilors should be provided the means to fulfill that; no, councilors should have regular employment while serving.

Question #10: In your opinion, do you feel that the established salaries for City Councilors are sufficient to not require additional sources of income?	5	The current compensation is adequate; absolutely not, the salary is below minimum wage and should be on par with comparable cities; the amount of time committed to the position is not compensated equivalently; impossible to live solely on a councilor salary.
Question #11: As an elected City Councilor, do you receive any other forms of compensation, such as investment, retirement, or outside employment?	6	Retirement income; personal investments; serves on other paid boards; holds another full-time job; no other forms of compensation are received; self-employed; spouse works.
Question #12: In your opinion, is the salary established for the position of Mayor-elect reflective of the position's responsibilities and the time necessary to perform them?	5	Yes, should be paid similar to comparable cities; others did not have a strong opinion on this; unsure, but likely.
Question #13: In your opinion, how does the salary established for the position of Mayor-elect impact an individual's decision to run for office? If so, in what ways?	5	Salary could impact the decision to run for some; the salary seems in line with the workload and is sufficient to support a family; salary is important but should not be the reason people run for office; unsure; would request a pay cut if elected Mayor.
Question #14: In your opinion, does the salary established for the position of Mayor-elect present any economic barriers to potential candidates considering running for office? If so, in what way?	5	No, a majority feel the salary is sufficient for the workload, however, the pay should be comparable to like cities. Others did not have a strong opinion on the matter.

Question #15:		City Councilor Salaries should be in
Please list any additional	1	the range of \$90,000 to \$100,000 if
comments you may have.		the job is expected to be their only
		source of income.

Chief Administrative Officer and Council Services Director Survey Results

A 19-question survey was administered electronically to the Chief Administrative Officer and Director of Council Services. The questions primarily centered around whether the responsibilities of elected positions have changed and whether the established salaries for elected officials affect those that would like to run for office.

Question	Responses ⁴
Question #1: In your opinion, what are the essential duties of the Mayor-elect?	To manage and select employees and manage the day to day operations of the City.
Question #2: In your opinion, what is the minimum number of hours a week the position of Mayor-elect should be able to dedicate to adequately fulfill the responsibilities of the position?	 (only one respondent provided a response) 50 – 55 hours per week, includes after hours and weekend events in the community. (only one respondent provided a response)
Question #3: In your opinion, have the responsibilities required of the Mayor- elect position expanded, contracted, or remained unchanged over the years, and if so, in what ways?	Expanded over the years. With the influence of social media and the post-pandemic changes to our society, this has increased the expectations of city elected officials significantly. <i>(only one respondent provided a response)</i>
Question #4: In your opinion, how does the salary established for the position of Mayor- elect impact an individual's decision to run for office? If so, in what ways?	The personal demands of the individual and their families and the compensation are primary considerations for anyone seeking political elected office. The compensation of the Mayor is inadequate for the level of

⁴ Multiple responses received to the same questions are not reflected in a particular or consistent order.

	responsibilities and the expectations of the community. Personal economic factors, by necessity, are a limiting factor for working people seeking to serve their community. The position of Mayor is very high functioning, and individuals with the capacity to pursue and succeed in this type of role often have skills that are of a higher economic value than the Office can currently pay.
Question #5: In your opinion, does the salary established for the Mayor present any economic barriers to potential candidates considering running for office? If so, in what way?	Yes. The compensation needs to reflect the duties that are required of the position. Yes. Many highly qualified candidates would be better served economically to seek employment rather than this elected office.
Question #6: In your opinion, do you feel that the established salary for the position of	No
Mayor-elect is sufficient to not require additional sources of income?	No
Question #7: The position of Mayor of Albuquerque is a full-time position and the position's established annual salary is currently	Increased
\$132,500. In your opinion, should the salary for the position of the next Mayor-elect be increased, decreased, or unchanged? (Select one option)	Increased

Question #8: In your opinion, what factors should be considered in evaluating the salary for the position of Mayor-elect?	Charter limitation on outside employment which effectively limits the Mayor's earning potential to the Mayor's City salary; the 24/7 nature of the job which requires personal investment beyond that associated with most general employment options; given the all-consuming nature of the job that requires daily investment and high-level decision making, Mayors should not also carry the personal burden and distraction of challenged personal finances.
	The Mayor's position as the head of a billion dollar organization, in the private sector the compensation would be significantly higher. At a minimum, the Mayor's salary should be commiserate to the salary of a University President or of a CEO of a major company within the city such as PNM, Presbyterian etc.
Question #9: In your opinion, what are the essential duties of an elected City Councilor?	Lead and advance city-wide policy development and progress; consider, and as appropriate, establish laws that promote the health, safety, and welfare of the City; advocate, lead and advance the civic interests of their individual districts; serve as a community representative and liaison for their respective districts; establish the budget; monitor the City's approach and performance to its essential function and advance policy improvements for the same.
	To represent the needs of their constituents in their respective districts. They also have a responsibility to represent the city as a whole and balance that with the needs of their district.
Question #10: In your opinion, what is the minimum number of hours a week an elected	10 -15
City Councilor should be able to dedicate to adequately fulfill the responsibilities of the position?	25

Question #11: In your opinion, have the responsibilities required of the position of elected City Councilors expanded, contracted, or remained unchanged over the years, and if so, in what ways?	They have expanded due to the growing challenges in the City, and as a consequence of time under the same form of government - the role of Councilor has been developing for over 50 years. To some extent yes they have expanded, however, City Councilors now have a larger staff to support their work which makes their positions more manageable.
Question #12: In your opinion, do the salaries established for the positions of elected City Councilors impact an individual's decision to run for office? If so, in what ways?	City Councilors' pay is too low for the amount of time and the expectations of the position. Personal economic factors, by necessity, are a limiting factor for working people seeking to serve their community. The position of Councilor is very high functioning and demanding, making it very difficult to maintain full-time outside employment while also maintaining family/personal obligations. This appears to limit the pool of people who can run for Councilor to those who are self- employed or retired.
Question #13: In your opinion, do the salaries established for positions of elected City Councilors present any economic barriers to potential candidates considering running for office? If so, in what way?	Yes, compensation for the work required is an important consideration for anyone seeking to run for office. Yes
Question #14: In your opinion, would the citizens of Albuquerque benefit from their elected City Councilors being able to dedicate full-time attention to their roles?	The staff of the City Council really helps perform the work needed Not necessarily.
Question #15: In your opinion, do you feel that the established salaries for City Councilors are sufficient to not require additional sources of income?	No Yes

Question 16: The positions of elected City Councilors of Albuquerque are considered part-time positions and the established annual salary for Councilors is \$33,660. Do you believe the salaries for the positions of the next elected City Councilors should be increased, decreased, or unchanged? (Select one option)	Increased
Question 17: The position of City Council President is considered a part-time position and the established annual salary for the position of Council President is \$35,860. Do you believe the salary for the position of the next elected Council President should be increased, decreased, or unchanged? (Select one option)	Increased
Question 18: In your opinion, what factors should be considered in evaluating the salaries for the positions of elected City Councilors and Council President?	In addition to the factors of time and responsibility. Councilor salaries should bear some relationship to the Mayor's. If the Mayor's job is full-time "plus," and the Councilors jobs are essentially part-time "plus," then the Councilor salaries should be 50% of the Mayor's. This seems fair since, although Councilors are not prohibited from outside employment, their service on Council likely diminishes their capacity for it by at least 50%. Time to do the job correctly and level of commitment to working on community issues.
Question #19: Please list any additional comments you may have.	(No responses received)

Public Survey Results

A 15-question survey was made available to the public. The survey questions primarily surrounded whether the responsibilities of elected positions have changed, whether the established salaries for elected officials affect those that would like to run for office, what factors should be considered in evaluating the salaries of elected officials, and whether the salaries should be adjusted.

As of noon on February 24, 2023, 182 responses to the survey were received. While the graphs below reflect respondents' views on adjusting the salaries of Albuquerque elected officials, the entirety of the responses can be found on the Commission's website located at https://www.cabq.gov/audit/citizens-independent-salary-commission.

The position of Mayor of Albuquerque is a full-time position and the position's established annual salary is currently \$132,500. In your opinion, should the salary for the position of the next Mayor-elect be increased, decreased, or unchanged? (Select one option)



The positions of elected City Councilors of Albuquerque are considered part-time positions and the established annual salary for Councilors is \$33,660. Do you believe the salaries for the positions of the next elected City Councilors should be increased, decreased, or unchanged? (Select one option)



The position of City Council President is considered a part-time position and the established annual salary for the position of Council President is \$35,860. Do you believe the salary for the position of the next elected Council President should be increased, decreased, or unchanged? (Select one option)



Changes within the City of Albuquerque

Assessing the managerial complexities of the Mayor and City Councilors is difficult, as many factors suggesting increased complexity may be intrinsically linked with factors such as the city budget and the number of people the City employs, as well as population size. To this point, since fiscal year 2012 the City's budget has increased 62 percent from \$878 million to \$1.4 billion, the number of budgeted full-time employees has increased 19 percent from 5,822 to 6,911,⁶ and the overall city population of Albuquerque has increased 2 percent from 555,100 to 564,600. The below graphs detail this information.⁵ In comparison, since fiscal year 2012 the salary established for the Mayor has increased 21 percent from \$109,325 to \$132,500, the salary of the City Council President has increased 84 percent from \$19,500 to \$35,860, and the salaries of City Councilors have increased 92 percent from \$17,500 to \$33,660.



⁶ The majority of the increase in full-time employee positions was within the Albuquerque Police and Fire Departments, the Department of Technology and Innovation, and the newly created Albuquerque Community Safety Department. See City of Albuquerque, "Approved Budget Fiscal Year 2023," pp. 40-41,

<<u>https://www.cabq.gov/dfa/documents/fy23-approved-budget-final-sept-13.pdf</u>>, accessed February 22, 2023. ⁵ These graphs were created by auditors based on the U.S Census Bureau and the City of Albuquerque's approved budgets for fiscal years 2012 through 2023.



Mayor and Councilors Salary Information

While most city employees received annual cost of living salary increases of at least 2 percent from fiscal years 2015 through 2022, elected officials have not. In fiscal year 2023, the equivalent of a 5 percent cost of living adjustment was appropriated for employees. Since the Commission's inception, the Mayor has received two salary increases and City Councilors have received three salary increases. These salary increases are detailed below.

- In 2015, the following salary increases were given:
 - Mayor's salary increased 14 percent from \$109,325 to \$125,000

- Council President's salary increased 64 percent from \$19,500 to \$32,000
- Councilors' salaries increased 71 percent from \$17,500 to \$30,000
- In 2019, the following salary increases were given:
 - Council President's salary increased 1 percent from \$32,000 to \$32,600
 - Councilors' salaries increased 2 percent from \$30,000 to \$30,600
- In 2021, the following salary increases were given:
 - Mayor's salary increased 6 percent from \$125,000 to \$132,500
 - Council President's salary increased 10 percent from \$32,600 to \$35,860
 - Councilors' salaries increased 10 percent from \$30,600 to \$33,660

The graph below details the Mayor and City Councilor's salaries since the inception of the Commission.⁶



While the City Charter is silent on the matter, City Council members are considered parttime City employees. Although their salaries, first set in 1974, are reflective of service in a part-time capacity, many of them reported working more than 40 hours a week. In contrast, City Charter explicitly states that the Mayor is required to devote full-time attention to the performance of the duties of the office and not hold other paid employment. To this point, the Mayor reported working approximately 70 hours a week.

⁶ These graphs were created by auditors based on the Commission's issued reports from 2013 to 2015.

EXECUTIVE LEADERSHIP AND DEPARTMENT DIRECTOR SALARIES

According to the City's 2023 approved budget, there are 26 departments. The table below includes the salaries established for each department director, as well as for the Mayor and his executive leadership, as of January 2023.

Title	Annual Salary
Chief Administrative Officer	\$ 220,522
Chief of Police	\$ 209,810
Chief Financial Officer	\$ 180,627
Chief of Staff	\$ 179,566
Chief Operations Officer	\$ 175,011
Fire Chief	\$ 173,264
Council Services Director	\$ 170,165
Associate Chief Administrative Officer	\$ 170,102
City Attorney	\$ 168,022
Department of Technology and Innovation Director	\$ 168,022
Planning Department Director	\$ 162,760
Albuquerque Community Safety Department Director	\$ 157,518
Animal Welfare Services Director	\$ 157,518
Aviation Director	\$ 157,518
City Clerk	\$ 157,518
Arts and Culture Director	\$ 157,518
Department of Economic Development Director	\$ 157,518
Department of Finance and Administrative Services Director	\$ 157,518
Department of Municipal Development Director	\$ 157,518
Environmental Health Department Director	\$ 157,518
Family Community Services Director	\$ 157,518
General Services Department Director	\$ 157,518
Human Resources Department Director	\$ 157,518
Parks and Recreation Director	\$ 157,518
Senior Affairs Director	\$ 157,518
Solid Waste Director	\$ 157,518
Transit Director	\$ 157,518
Mayor	\$ 132,500
Civilian Police Oversight Agency Executive Director	\$ 127,046
City Auditor	\$ 113,422
Inspector General	\$ 110,240

Changes in Cost of Living and Inflation

The Commission analyzed the changes in the cost of living index for the City of Albuquerque, as defined by the U.S. Bureau of Labor Statistics (BLS) and the U.S Census Bureau. The Commission utilized the BLS Consumer Price Index (CPI), which measures of the average change overtime in the prices paid by urban consumers for a market basket of consumer goods and services. Per examination of the cost analysis index, the cost of living in the Western Region⁷ has increased by 74.69 basis points (20.3 percent) from 2015 to 2022. The table below details this information.



The Commission analyzed the changes in the average U.S. inflation rate based on the monthly inflation rate reported by BLS. BLS defines inflation as the overall upward price movement of goods and services in an economy. This is often referred to as the change in the buying power of the dollar. The inflation rate is a measurement of inflation, the rate of increase of a price index. Per examination of the U.S. monthly inflation rates, inflation increased 6.2 percent in 2022. The table below details the U.S. average annual inflation rate from 2006 through 2022.

⁷ The western region includes Alaska, Arizona, California, Colorado, Hawaii, Idaho, Montana, Nevada, New Mexico, Oregon, Utah, Washington, and Wyoming.



Albuquerque Median Income

The Commission also analyzed changes in the median household income for Albuquerque, as defined by BLS and the U.S Census Bureau. The median household income is a measurement of the income level earned by a given household where half of the homes in the area earn more and half earn less. The CPI for Albuquerque includes all of New Mexico and the rest of the Western Region states including Alaska, Arizona, California, Colorado, Hawaii, Idaho, Montana, Nevada, Oregon, Utah, Washington, and Wyoming. Median household income, on the other hand, is based on the U.S. Census Bureau's Annual Community Survey and provides a basis for measuring changes in the median Albuquerque household's regularly received income and includes all regularly received income. The table below details the change in the Albuquerque median income from 2013 through 2021.

Taken together, the cost of living index, inflation, and median household income allowed the Commission to better evaluate the salaries of the Mayor and Councilors against these factors. Specifically, the median income for Albuquerque has increased by \$14,488, or 30 percent from \$48,355 in 2013 to \$62,843 in 2021.⁸ Further, while the current salary established for the Mayor \$132,500 is 211 percent of the median household income in Albuquerque for 2021, the current Councilors' and Council President's salaries of \$33,660 and \$35,860, respectively, are only 54 and 57 percent of the median household income of Albuquerque for the same period.

⁸ Complete information for all four factors was not available for 2022.



Benchmarking

The Commission looked beyond the City of Albuquerque to understand how other comparable cities compensate their elected officials and examined not only salaries in those cities but also structural differences that may affect municipal officials' compensation levels. Although no single benchmark for comparison was determinative, benchmarking proved a useful tool for analyzing the appropriate range within which to recommend Albuquerque's Mayor and City Councilors should be compensated.

In addition to our broad consideration of factors including affordability, economic wellbeing, and managerial complexity, the Commission identified ten⁹ comparable cities and Las Cruces, NM, and Santa Fe, NM, and for all 12 cities analyzed their mayoral and legislative compensation and employment status. For purposes of the analysis, full-time and part-time employment status were defined as follows:

Full-Time Employment Status	Part-Time Employment Status
The charter or code explicitly	The charter or code explicitly
defines the position as full-time.	defines the position as part-time.

⁹ The Commission benchmarked the following ten cities: El Paso, TX; Fresno, CA; Kansas City, MO; Little Rock, AR; Louisville, KY; Mesa, AZ; Milwaukee, WI; Oklahoma City, OK; Portland, OR; and Tucson, AZ. The Commission also included Las Cruces, NM; and Santa Fe, NM for regional comparison.

The charter or code has a clause that the role ought to be the primary responsibility.	The charter or code is silent on the matter.
A prohibition against outside employment exists.	Pay is on a per-meeting basis.

When the city charter or code is silent on the matter, factors such as the number of weekly hours required of sessions, constituent services, and committee work, whether sessions are held year-round, the size of the support staff provided to the elected official, whether the established salary was equivalent to the cites' living wage, should be considered when evaluating whether a position's employment status is full-time or part-time. However, information on these factors was not readily available for all the cities identified.

The analysis found that six cities operate or will soon operate¹⁰ under the same Mayor-Council government structure utilized by Albuquerque and the other six utilize a Council-Manager structure. While the Mayors of eight of the 12 cities serve in full-time capacities, only the City of Santa Fe's Charter explicitly stipulates that the Mayor shall be a full-time position. While the city charter or code does not prohibit the Mayors of these 11 cities from having outside employment, the Mayoral salaries averaged \$139,292 and ranged from \$85,013 to \$180,895. Further, the Mayors in these cities are entitled to the same employee benefits entitled to all city employees.

Regarding Councilors, the analysis found that all cities do not prohibit councilors from holding outside-city employment. Councilors received salaries ranging from \$12,000 and \$125,694, averaging \$54,817. However, three cities reported that their councilors serve in a full-time capacity and Councilors in these cities received salaries averaging \$103,412 and ranging from \$73,222 to \$125,694, with council presidents earning between \$82,749 and \$125,694 and on average \$111,226. Four cities did not provide employee benefits to councilors or the council president.

Only two of the cities benchmarked provided for additional compensation for the council president. The range of pay for Council Presidents benchmarked is \$6,250 to \$110,725, with the mean being approximately \$61,182 and the median being \$65,359. These cities pay the Council President roughly 11 to 29 percent more than councilors. While Albuquerque pays the Councilor President 6.5 percent more than Councilors. See Appendix A for further details regarding the complete analysis.

¹⁰ Portland, OR currently utilizes a Commission structure. However, in November 2022, Portland voters passed Measure 26-228 changing the structure to a Mayor-Council structure expanding the city council to 12 members, with a City Administrator to manage daily operations.

Summary of Results

The Commission approached its evaluation with the purpose of establishing a fair and reasonable compensation for the elected officials of Albuquerque, while also considering the current financial circumstances of the City. The Commission's intent was to ensure that the Mayor and City Councilors positions are compensated for the time and effort expended on behalf of the citizens of Albuquerque. The Commission's objective was to ensure these positions are compensated at a level that is reasonable when compared to the compensation paid to elected officials of comparable cities; a level that is likely to attract competent and effective candidates to serve in public office and that enhances the opportunity for every eligible citizen to serve, regardless of their financial circumstance.

The major factors contributing to the Commission's determination are as follows:

- The Commission recognizes that most other city employees have received cost of living increases of at least 2 percent from fiscal years 2015 through 2022, while elected officials have not. In fiscal year 2023, the equivalent of a 5 percent cost of living adjustment was appropriated for employees. In the Western Region, the cost of living has increased by 20.3 percent since 2015. The Mayor is the Chief Executive Officer of a government body that serves a population of 564,559 with a budget of \$1.4 billion dollars and over 6,900 city employees. These things considered, a decision was made to increase the Mayoral salary by 10.25 percent (5% for 2021 and an additional 5% for 2022).
- The Commission recognizes that most other city employees have received cost of living increases of at least 2 percent from fiscal years 2015 through 2022, while elected officials have not. In fiscal year 2023, the equivalent of a 5 percent cost of living adjustment was appropriated for employees. The median income for Albuquerque was \$62,843 in 2021 and the cost of living has increased 20.3 percent. In addition, responses received from surveys completed by City Councilors and Administration, the scope of work for the role, specialization, and level of professional experience needed were considered by the Commission. As a result, a decision was made to increase the salaries of Councilors to \$62,843 which will better align their salary to their counterparts in peer municipalities with similar government structures.
- The Commission considered the additional duties of the Council President and a decision was made to apply the same 6.5 percent difference between the Council President's and City Councilors' salaries that currently exists.

The Commission carefully reviews the salaries of the Mayor and Council every two years, so it has the ability to react to changing economic conditions and realities, and elects:

- Commission agrees to increase Mayor's salary by \$13,581, 5% for 2021 and an additional 5% for 2022.
- Commission agrees to increase Council salaries by \$29,183, or 86.7 percent.
- Commission agrees to increase Council President salary by \$31,068, or 86.6 percent.

Salary Information

Mayor salary – \$146,081.00 City Councilors salary – \$62,843.00 Council President salary – \$66,928.00

Conclusion

The citizens of Albuquerque elected to establish the Citizens' Independent Salary Commission. In compliance with meeting the objectives of the Commission, the decision-making process included the research, analysis, discussion, and application of a wide range of facts concerning the salary structure of the Mayor and City Councilors of Albuquerque. This is an exhaustive process in which rigorous standards and documentation are maintained. Review of data and documents can be obtained by contacting the Office of Internal Audit (505) 768-3154. In conclusion, the Commission thanks the Mayor and the City Council for their dedicated service to the City of Albuquerque and its residents.

APPENDIX A

COMPARABLE CITIES BENCHMARKING ANALYSIS

City	City Population (2020 Census Data)	Median Household Income (Census Bureau 2017-2021 in 2021 dollars)	City Operating Budget FY23	City FTEs FY23	Government Structure	Annual 2023 Minimum Wage	Mayor FT or PT According to Charter	Legislative Body FT or PT According to Charter	Mayor 2022 Salary	Mayor Benefits	Council 2022 Salary	Council Benefits	Council President 2022 Salary	Council President Benefits	Salaries Set By
Albuquerque, NM	564,559	\$58,512	\$1,421,304,000	6,911	Mayor- Council	\$24,960	Required to devote FT attention to the performance of the duties of the office and not hold other paid employment	Charter is silent; serves in a PT capacity	\$132,500	Entitled to all City benefits	\$33,660	Entitled to all City benefits	\$35,860	Entitled to all City benefits	Citizens' Independent Salary Commission
El Paso, TX	865,657	\$51,044	\$1,171,086,079	7,263	Council- Manager	\$15,080	No Council member may hold any other compensated public office or public employment	No Council member may hold any other compensated public office or public employment	\$77,400	Entitled to all City benefits	\$51,600	Entitled to all City benefits	\$51,600	Entitled to all City benefits	Salaries are tied to El Paso County area median household income per HUD
Kansas City, MO	508,090	\$60,042	\$1,931,406,916	5,571	Council- Manager	\$24,960	Prohibited from holding any City employment or elected public officer	Prohibited from holding any City employment or elected public officer	\$141,455	Entitled to all City benefits	\$70,718	Entitled to all City benefits	\$70,718	Entitled to all City benefits	Salaries are established by Council
Oklahoma City, OK	681,054	\$59,214	\$1,836,069,415	4,989	Council- Manager	\$15,080	Charter is silent; serves in in a PT capacity	Charter is silent; serves in in a PT capacity	\$24,000	Not eligible to receive benefits	\$12,000	Not eligible to receive benefits	\$12,000	Not eligible to receive benefits	Established in Charter
Fresno, CA	542,107	\$61,250	\$1,907,231,100	5,662	Mayor- Council	\$32,240	Charter is silent; serves in a FT capacity	Charter is silent; serves in a FT capacity	\$180,895	Entitled to all City benefits; \$10,200 in expenses; \$12,245 City contribution to Deferred Comp	\$111,320	Entitled to all City benefits; \$9,000 in expenses	\$125,235	Entitled to all City benefits; \$10,125 in expenses	The Independent Compensation Commission makes recommendations to Council. Salaries are established by Council

City	City Population (2020 Census Data)	Median Household Income (Census Bureau 2017-2021 in 2021 dollars)	City Operating Budget FY23	City FTEs FY23	Government Structure	Annual 2023 Minimum Wage	Mayor FT or PT According to Charter	Legislative Body FT or PT According to Charter	Mayor 2022 Salary	Mayor Benefits	Council 2022 Salary	Council Benefits	Council President 2022 Salary	Council President Benefits	Salaries Set By
Mesa, AZ	504,258	\$69,266	\$2,300,000,000	4,399	Council- Manager	\$28,808	Prohibited from holding any City employment or elected public officer	Prohibited from holding any City employment or elected public officer	\$74,745	Entitled to all City benefits; \$1,200 in expenses; Not eligible for Deferred Comp	\$41,782	Entitled to all City benefits; \$1,200 in expenses; Not eligible for Deferred Comp	\$41,782	Entitled to all City benefits; \$1,200 in expenses; Not eligible for Deferred Comp	Independent Commission on Compensation for Elected Officials
Milwaukee, WI	577,222	\$46,637	\$1,715,815,193	7,817	Mayor- Council	\$15,080	Charter is silent; serves in a FT capacity	Charter is silent; serves in a FT capacity	\$147,336	Entitled to all City benefits	\$73,222	Entitled to all City benefits	\$82,749	Entitled to all City benefits	Common Council
Louisville, KY	386,884	\$58,357	\$1,273,851,785	5,008	Mayor- Council	\$15,080	Charter is silent; serves in a FT capacity	Charter is silent; serves in a FT capacity	\$140,366	Entitled to all City benefits	\$51,258	Not eligible to receive benefits	\$51,258	Not eligible to receive benefits	Council
Little Rock, AR	202,591	\$53,565	\$315,406,222	1,766	Council- Manager	\$22,568	Charter is silent; serves in a FT capacity	Charter is silent; serves in in a PT capacity	\$176,500	Compensated with a salary and benefit package comparable to the highest- ranking municipal official	\$18,000	\$3,000 annual office allowance	\$18,000	\$3,000 annual office allowance	Established in Charter
Portland, OR	652,503	\$79,057	\$5,446,508,280	7,201	Commission	\$28,080	Charter is silent; serves in a FT capacity	Charter is silent; serves in a FT capacity	\$149,261	Entitled to all benefits offered by the City	\$125,694	Entitled to all benefits offered by the City	\$125,694	Entitled to all benefits offered by the City	Salaries currently set by Council but will be set by the Independent Salary Commission

City	City Population (2020 Census Data)	Median Household Income (Census Bureau 2017-2021 in 2021 dollars)	City Operating Budget FY23	City FTEs FY23	Government Structure	Annual 2023 Minimum Wage	Mayor FT or PT According to Charter	Legislative Body FT or PT According to Charter	Mayor 2022 Salary	Mayor Benefits	Council 2022 Salary	Council Benefits	Council President 2022 Salary	Council President Benefits	Salaries Set By
Tucson, AZ	542,629	\$50,306	\$1,919,982,740	4,735	Council- Manager	\$28,808	Charter is silent; serves in in a PT capacity	Charter is silent; serves in in a PT capacity	\$42,000	Not eligible to receive benefits	\$24,000	Not eligible to receive benefits	\$24,000	Not eligible to receive benefits	Citizens' Commission on Public Service and Compensation make recommendations. Changes approved only by ballot measure
Las Cruces, NM	111,385	\$42,058	\$499,632,525	1,863	Council- Manager	\$24,960	The Mayor shall not hold any other elected public office or city employment during the term for which the individual was elected	No councilor shall hold any other elected public office or city employment during the term for which the individual was elected	\$85,013	Entitled to all City benefits	\$39,106	Entitled to all City benefits	\$39,106	Entitled to all City benefits	Council
Santa Fe, NM	154,823	\$67,341	\$382,838,184	1,400	Mayor- Council	\$24,960	The Mayor is the CEO of the city whose position shall be full-time	Charter is silent; serves in in a PT capacity	\$110,011	Entitled to all City benefits	\$39,106	Entitled to all City benefits	\$39,106	Entitled to all City benefits	Independent Salary Commission sets Mayor's salary. Council sets their own salaries