



Landmarks & Urban
Conservation Commission



Agenda Number: 5
Case No.: 09LUCC-50041
Project # 1007716
March 17, 2010

Supplemental Staff Report #4

Agent	No	<p>Staff Recommendation</p> <p>APPROVAL of Case # 09LUCC-50041, Project #1007716, a request for a Certificate of Appropriateness for alteration, based on the Findings 1-18 beginning on page 3 and subject to the conditions on page 4.</p> <p style="text-align: right;">Maryellen Hennessy Staff Planner</p>
Applicant	Sylvain Steinlauf	
Request	<i>Certificate of Appropriateness for alteration</i>	
Legal Description	Tract 164, MRGCD Map 38	
Address/Location	109 Romero NW	
Size		
Zoning	H-1	
Historic Location	Old Town Historic Overlay Zone	

Summary of Analysis

The application is for a Certificate of Appropriateness for alteration at 109 Romero NW in the Old Town Historic Overlay Zone.

In August of 2008, a window on the east elevation of the building was altered without a Certificate of Appropriateness. Zoning Enforcement Division issued a stop work order.

The building at 109 Romero is a New Mexico Vernacular style building, built as a dwelling, circa 1908. The building retains the characteristic architectural features of the style and period of construction. It is a Contributing property in the State registered Old Albuquerque Historic District.

This case was continued from the October 14, 2009 hearing, and deferred from November 18, 2009, December 9, 2009 and January 13, 2010 public hearings. The applicant has presented revised drawings for the proposal.

Although enlarging the window opening is not consistent with applicable guidelines, the building still retains its historic architectural character.

PRIMARY REFERENCES:

Landmarks and Urban Conservation Ordinance; Design Guidelines for the Old Town Historic Overlay Zone.

City Departments and other interested agencies were given the opportunity to review this application from 9/17/09 to 9/31/09. Agency comments that were received were used in the preparation of this report, and begin on page 13 of original staff report.

Background

This report is supplemental report #4 to the original staff report dated October 14, 2009 and is intended to be read in conjunction with that report. Only new information and analysis is presented here. The October 14, 2009 staff report contains important background information and evidence associated with this request. Supplemental staff reports #2 and #3 should be disregarded for the purposes of this new analysis.

At the October 14, 2009 hearing, the applicant proposed an alternative to the existing window. Revised drawings have been submitted that clearly demonstrate the construction details of the proposed alteration.

ANALYSIS

It is proposed to insert a mullion in the center of the opening and install two separate pieces of glass. The intent is to provide a more vertical emphasis to the window, consistent with other windows on the buildings.

The work that is currently in place and proposed to be kept in place utilizes plywood for the window casing. The other window openings on the façade use dimensional lumber as would be typical of a building of this period. The details of each of the three windows on the east façade vary. One window replaced the original sashes with fixed glass and uses a very small parting stop. This is a somewhat unusual detail and not recommended. A narrower window has the original wood sashes and a more appropriate detail that includes some molding. Both of those windows have wooden sills of two by lumber.

CONCLUSION

The conclusions contained in the October 14, 2009 staff report still stand with regard to the appropriateness of enlarging the window opening on this historic building. However, the opening has already been enlarged and the applicant proposes a modification to mitigate the visual impact.

Despite this one alteration, the building still retains a sufficient amount of its original historic architectural character in spite of the wider window. It would not be recommended to consider altering any of the other windows on this building in the future.

However, the quality of the work and the finish detail is important to produce a window that is in keeping with the buildings. It is recommended that the plywood be replaced with dimensional lumber and that the window be constructed with a detail similar to the window with the wood sashes.

FINDINGS for a request for a Certificate of Appropriateness for alteration - Case #09LUCC-50041 / Project # 1007716 (March 17, 2010)

1. This application is a request for a Certificate of Appropriateness for alteration at 109 Romero, described as Tract 164, MRGCD Map 38, in the Old Town Historic Overlay Zone, and zoned H-1.
2. The subject site is a Contributing property in the State registered Old Albuquerque Historic District.
3. The proposal is to enlarge the original window opening to accommodate a wider storefront window.
4. In August of 2008, an existing window on the east façade was removed, and the opening was made wider.
5. Section 14-16-2-25(D)(1) of the Comprehensive Zoning Code states “Any construction, modification, addition, alteration, moving or destruction which would affect the exterior appearance of any structure or place in the H-1 zone requires a Certificate of Appropriateness which must be approved by the Landmarks and Urban Conservation Commission.”
6. The work was implemented without a Certificate of Appropriateness. A Zoning Enforcement stop work order was issued.
7. The building at 109 Romero is one component of a group of buildings assembled, over time, in a linear pattern along Romero St. between South Plaza and Old Town Road.
8. 109 Romero is a New Mexico Vernacular style building, built as a dwelling, circa 1908. The building retains the characteristic architectural features of the style and period of construction.
9. The adjacent building at 105-107 Romero was constructed circa 1950’s and is not a Contributing property in the Old Albuquerque Historic District. Window openings on the front façade of this building are consistent with the period of construction and may be original to the building.

10. The adjacent building at 121 Romero was constructed circa 1890's as a commercial building. Two large window openings flank the ten-foot tall main entry door, a feature consistent with its use as a general store.
11. The proposal to enlarge the window opening on the front façade of the subject building is not consistent with the specific development guidelines for the Old Town Historic Overlay Zone numbers 1, 2, 3, 6, 7, and 9. The proposed alteration destroys distinguishing qualities and architectural character of the property and its environment as analyzed in the staff report.
12. The LUC Ordinance Section 14-12(8)(B)(2) states that a Certificate of Appropriateness shall be approved if "The architectural character, historical value, or archaeological value of the structure or site itself or of any historic zone or urban conservation overlay zone in which it is located will not be significantly impaired or diminished".
13. This request does not comply with LUCC Ordinance sections 14-12-8-(B)(1), (B)(2), (B)(4) and (B)(5) as analyzed in the staff report. Enlarging the window opening is not consistent with the specific development guidelines for the overlay zone, it diminished the architectural character and historical value of the historic building, it altered the structure's and site's distinguished original qualities or character and does not match the original feature.
14. At the October 14, 2009 hearing, the applicant proposed an alternative to the larger window. The case was continued to the November hearing to allow the applicant time to prepare a measured drawing and for staff to respond to the new proposal. The case was subsequently deferred from the November and December 2009 and January 2010 public hearings.
15. A revised proposal submitted and dated March 8, 2010 for the alteration includes inserting a mullion in the center of the wider window. This modification results in two vertically oriented windows, an effect that is more consistent with the other window openings in the subject building and mitigates the impact of the alteration on the historic building.
16. The construction detail of the work that is in place is not consistent with other windows on the east façade.
17. The building at 109 Romero NW retains a high degree of historic and architectural integrity despite the alteration of the window.
18. The Albuquerque/Bernalillo County Comprehensive Plan contains goals and policies related to Environmental Protections and Heritage Conservation. Section 11.C.5 Historic Resources

goal is to protect, reuse, or enhance significant historic districts and buildings. The revised proposal subject to the stated conditions of approval supports the Historic Resources goal.

19. Section 11.C.9 Community Identity and Urban Design goal is “to preserve and enhance the natural and built characteristics, social, cultural and historical features that identify Albuquerque and Bernalillo County sub-areas as distinct communities and collections of neighborhoods.” Policy b states “In each Community Area, strategic planning, neighborhood planning, development and redevelopment shall be evaluated in light of its relationship to and effect upon (3) Local history, specifically architectural styles and traditions and current and historic significance to Albuquerque. The revised proposal subject to the stated conditions of approval supports the Community Identity and Urban Design goal.

RECOMMENDED CONDITIONS OF APPROVAL:

1. The existing plywood casing is to be replaced with dimensional lumber and the finish detail is to be similar to the narrow window to the south of the subject window. Revised drawings to be submitted to staff for review and approval.
2. The approval of this alteration does not imply that it would be appropriate to enlarge other windows on the subject building. Any future alterations should conserve the remaining historic and architectural integrity of the site.
3. The applicant is to comply with all other relevant City of Albuquerque permits, policies and procedures.

RECOMMENDATION - Case No. 09LUCC-50041 / Project # 1007716

APPROVAL of Case #09LUCC-50041 / Project # 1007716, an application for a Certificate of Appropriateness for alteration located at 109 Romero NW. This property is more specifically described as Tract 164 MRGCD map 38, a property in the Old Town Historic Overlay Zone, zoned H-1, based on the above 19 Findings and subject to the above conditions.

**Maryellen Hennessy, Senior Planner,
Current Planning Division**

CITY OF ALBUQUERQUE AGENCY COMMENTS

ZONING CODE SERVICES DIVISION

NO COMMENT

BUILDING & SAFETY SERVICES DIVISION

BUILDING PERMIT REQUIRED.

HISTORIC PRESERVATION/ADVANCED PLANNING

NO RESPONSE

TRANSPORTATION PLANNING

PNM

ENVIRONMENTAL HEALTH DEPARTMENT

SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT DEPARTMENT

FIRE DEPARTMENT/Planning

COMMENTS FROM OTHER AGENCIES, WHEN APPLICABLE:

TRANSIT DEPARTMENT

POLICE DEPARTMENT

PARKS AND GENERAL SERVICES

OPEN SPACE DIVISION

BERNALILLO COUNTY

ALBUQUERQUE FLOOD CONTROL AUTHORITY

ALBUQUERQUE PUBLIC SCHOOLS

MIDDLE RIO GRANDE COUNCIL OF GOVERNMENTS