



Landmarks & Urban
Conservation Commission



Agenda Number:
Case No.: 09LUCC-50026
Project # 1007906
August 12, 2009

Staff Report

Agent		<p>Staff Recommendation</p> <p>APPROVAL of Case # 09LUCC-50026, Project #1007906, a request for a Certificate of Appropriateness for alteration, based on the Findings 1-8 beginning on page 10 and subject to Conditions on page 11.</p> <p style="text-align: right;">Maryellen Hennessy Staff Planner</p>
Applicant	James and Leda Clark	
Request	Certificate of Appropriateness for alteration	
Legal Description	Lot 3&4 Block 6 Perea Addition	
Address/Location	516 11 th St. NW	
Size		
Zoning	SU-2/SF	
Historic Location	Fourth Ward Historic Overlay Zone	

Summary of Analysis

The application is for a Certificate of Appropriateness for alterations to the Contributing property at 516 11th St. in the Fourth Ward Historic Overlay Zone. The proposal is to reverse inappropriate alterations that occurred in the past. Exterior stucco will be removed to expose original wood shingle siding on the house. The front porch will be returned to an open porch by removing infill materials. Existing windows on the porch will be relocated on the new porch.

The proposed alterations are appropriate and the historic architectural character of 516 11th St. NW is sufficiently preserved to meet applicable guidelines.

PRIMARY REFERENCES:

Landmarks and Urban Conservation Ordinance; Design Guidelines for the Fourth Ward Historic District.

City Departments and other interested agencies were given the opportunity to review this application from 7/16/09 to 8/12/09. Agency comments that were received were used in the preparation of this report, and begin on page 12.

Development Review Division Report:

SUMMARY OF REQUEST

Requests	<i>Certificate of Appropriateness for alteration</i>
Historic Location	<i>Fourth Ward Historic Overlay Zone</i>

AREA HISTORY AND CHARACTER

Surrounding architectural styles, historic character and recent (re)development

	# of Stories	Roof Configuration, Architectural Style and Approximate Age of Construction	Historic Classification & Land Use
General Area	1-2	Craftsman Bungalow; Bungalow; Spanish Pueblo Revival; Mediterranean	Contributing, residential
Site to the North	1 1/2	Hipped, hipped box ca. 1910	Contributing, residential
Sites to the South	1 1/2	Hipped, hipped box ca. 1907	Contributing, residential
Sites to the East	1	Hipped, hipped box ca. 1910	Contributing, residential
Site to the West	1 1/2	Hipped, bungalow ca. 1920	Contributing, residential

Background

The Contributing property at 516 11th St. in the Fourth Ward Historic Overlay Zone is a one and one-half story hipped box of wood frame construction built in 1909/1910. A single gabled dormer with a composite window faces the front of the house. Prior to 1979, the original wood shingle cladding was covered with stucco and the open front porch was enclosed. Wood moldings on the windows were removed.

The proposal is to reverse the inappropriate alterations. Exterior stucco will be removed to expose original wood shingle siding, with shingles being repaired or replaced as warranted.

The front porch will be returned to an open porch by removing infill materials. Existing windows 16/1 sash windows on the porch will be relocated on the front façade. A doorway that was turned into a window will be reopened with a door to match the existing front door. The southern section of building wall will be reconstructed with new shingle siding. The cast cement block stem wall will be exposed. Tapered wood columns and a new railing will be added to complete the open porch.

APPLICABLE PLANS, ORDINANCES, DESIGN GUIDELINES & POLICIES

Albuquerque-Bernalillo County Comprehensive Plan of 1988, amended 2003

This site is a Historic Resource in terms used in the *Comprehensive Plan*. The plan sets out goals and policies concerning land use, environmental protection and heritage conservation. Chapter II, Section 5, Historic Resources Goals and Policies (pp. II-61-II-62) states:

“The Goal for Historic Resources is to protect, reuse or enhance significant historic buildings and districts.”

Applicable Historic Resources policies include:

Policy a: Efforts to provide incentives for the protection of significant buildings and districts shall be continued and expanded.

Policy b: Research, evaluation, and protection of historical and cultural properties in the City and County shall be continued where appropriate.

Policy c: Increase public and inter-agency awareness of historic resources and preservation

This site is contained in the Central Urban Development Area, a portion of the Established Urban Development Area as defined in the *Comprehensive Plan*, and is subject to the policies of Section II.B.5 (Established Urban Area) as well as the Central Urban Area policies. The Goal of the Central Urban Area is to “promote the Central Urban Area as a focus for arts, cultural, and public facilities/activities while recognizing and enhancing the character of its residential neighborhoods and its importance as the historic center of the City.”

The Goal of the Established Urban Area is to “create a quality urban environment which perpetuates the tradition of identifiable, individual, but integrated communities within the metropolitan area and which offers variety and maximum choice in housing, transportation, work areas, and life styles, while creating a visually pleasing built environment.”

Applicable Established Urban Area policies include:

Policy d: “The location, intensity, and design of new development shall respect existing neighborhood values, natural environmental conditions and carrying capacities, scenic resources, and resources of other social, cultural, and recreational concern.”

Policy o: “Redevelopment and rehabilitation of older neighborhoods in the Established Urban Area shall be continued and strengthened.”

It is pertinent to this request that on page 13 of the *Downtown Neighborhood Area Sector Development Plan*, it specifically cites the following policies from the 1975 *Albuquerque / Bernalillo County Comprehensive Plan - Policy Plan*:

Policy 1: “Redevelopment and rehabilitation of older neighborhoods should be continued and expanded.”

Policy 2: “Selected buildings and areas which explain our past and which give Albuquerque identity, individuality, and cultural richness shall be preserved, enhanced, and reused where appropriate.”

Resolution –046-1991 Designating the Fourth Ward and Eighth and Forrester Historic Overlay Zones (1991)

This resolution designated, mapped, and provided general guidelines for the establishment of the Fourth Ward and Eighth and Forrester Historic Overlay Zones. For this case, this resolution will be referred to only as it applies to the Fourth Ward Historic Overlay Zone and the subject property contained therein, excluding references to the Eighth and Forrester Historic Overlay Zone. Contained within this resolution are general guidelines, of which the specific Fourth Ward Historic Overlay Zone Design Guidelines are derived.

Fourth Ward Historic Overlay Zone Design Guidelines

The Landmarks and Urban Conservation Commission approved specific development guidelines as delegated by *Resolution –046-1991*. These guidelines were revised in 2002. The guidelines for Contributing Buildings (1.) are applicable to this case. The policy states "All alterations shall preserve the overall form and detail character of contributing buildings so that they continue to contribute to the character of the overlay zone." Section VI Miscellaneous Features is also applicable to this case. Section VI.A.1 states that "All site and right-of-way alterations shall be reviewed by the LUC for a Certificate of appropriateness."

Landmarks and Urban Conservation Ordinance

This site consists of a contributing property in the Fourth Ward Historic Overlay Zone. The project is subject to certain provisions of the Landmarks and Urban Conservation Ordinance (Article 12, R.O.A., 1994). The purpose of this ordinance is to:

"Preserve, protect, enhance, perpetuate and promote the use of structures and areas of historical, cultural, architectural, engineering, archeological or geographic significance located in the city; to strengthen the city's economic base by stimulating the tourist industry; to enhance the identity of the city by protecting the city's heritage and prohibiting the unnecessary destruction or defacement of its cultural assets; and to conserve existing urban developments as viable economic and social entities."

Section 14-12-8 (A) of the LUC ordinance provides that:

"Within the boundaries of a historic zone, urban conservation overlay zone, or landmark site, the exterior appearance of any structure shall not be altered, new structures shall not be constructed, and existing structures shall not be demolished until a Certificate of Appropriateness has been duly approved."

ANALYSIS

LUC Ordinance

The table below provides an evaluation of the submittal as it relates to the LUC Ordinance.

LUC Ordinance (§14-12)	Analysis	Does the application satisfy the ordinance criteria?
§14-12-8-B-(1) The change is consistent with the designation ordinance and specific development guidelines for the historic overlay zone	The proposal is consistent with the applicable provisions of the specific development guidelines and the designation ordinance as analyzed in the tables below.	YES
§14-12-8 (B) (2) The architectural character, historical value, or archaeological value of the structure or site itself or of any historic zone in which it is located will not be significantly impaired or diminished	The architectural character and historical value of the structure will be enhanced with the proposed reversal of inappropriate alterations.	YES
§14-12-8 (B) (3) The change qualified as a "certified rehabilitation: pursuant to the Tax Reform Act of 1976	Not applicable	
§14-12-8 (B) (4) The structure or site's distinguished original qualities or character will not be altered. Original shall mean at the time of initial construction or developed over the course of history of the structure.	The structure's distinguishing character was altered in the past. The proposed work will reverse the most damaging alterations.	YES
§14-12-8 (B) (5) Deteriorated architectural features should be repaired rather than replaced, if possible. If replacement is necessary, the new material shall match the original as closely as possible in like material and design;	Wood shingles will be repaired/replaced as necessary. Windows will be retained. Other elements of the porch structure are to be retained.	YES
§14-12-8 (B) (6) Additions to existing structure and new construction may be of contemporary design if such design is compatible with the historic zone in which it is to be located	Not applicable	
§14-12-8 (B) (7) Demolition shall only be permitted. . . .	Not applicable	

4TH Ward Guidelines

The table below provides an evaluation of the submittal as it relates to pertinent aspects of the 4th Ward Guidelines as approved by the LUCC in 2002.

Fourth Ward Historic Overlay Zone Design Guidelines	Analysis	Does the submittal satisfy the design guidelines?
1.A. General Guidelines	Does the submittal satisfy the design guidelines?	
1. Original materials and architectural features shall be retained wherever possible.	Original materials and features are retained.	YES
2. If the original materials cannot be used, new materials shall be identical to the original in size, proportion, texture and finish.	Dominant feature is hipped roof form, which is not affected by the proposal. No changes are proposed in this application for character defining features. No original material or features are to be removed.	YES
3. If a material or feature is too deteriorated to be repaired, and an identical material or feature is not technically feasible, a compatible substitute material may be submitted for consideration and approval. The new material shall convey the same visual appearance as the original.	Original materials will be retained where feasible. New wall section will have wood shingle siding to match existing.	YES
4. Replacement of inappropriate modern material with materials matching the original is encouraged. The replacement shall be based on historical, physical, or pictorial evidence.	The stucco exterior wall finish is not original to the building and will be removed in the rehabilitation. The infill materials on the porch will be removed and the physical evidence of an open porch is used to inform the design of the new porch.	YES
B. Exterior wall materials		
1. Materials original to the building and materials that match the original as closely as possible in size, proportion and pattern	There is to be some use of wooden shingles consistent with the original wood shingles on the house.	YES
2. Materials that are appropriate to the style of the structure.	See above	YES
C. Windows, Screens, Shutters, Awnings, Security, and Vents.		
1. Retention and repair of original windows is the preferred option. If replacement is necessary, the replacement shall	Original 16/1 wood sash windows will be returned to their likely original location on the front façade.	YES

<p>match the originals as closely as possible in size, proportion, operation (sash or casement), mullion pattern and material. The size of the window opening shall not be altered.</p>		
<p>2. Glass shall be clear in the majority of windows, but small amounts of stained or beveled glass may be appropriate and approved on a case-by-case basis.</p>	<p>Not applicable</p>	
<p>3. The addition of new window openings is discouraged. When new windows are necessary, they shall be placed only on the side of the building that does not face the street. The new windows shall be consistent with the design of the building's existing windows in size, design and materials.</p>	<p>Original 16/1 wood sash windows will be returned to their original location on the front façade.</p>	<p>YES</p>
<p>4. The use of interior screens, storm windows and shutters is encouraged. If this is not possible, exterior screens, storm windows, and shutters may be approved on a case-by-case basis.</p>	<p>Not applicable</p>	
<p>5. Such exterior items, if approved, shall match the existing doors and windows and shall be painted to match existing items.</p>	<p>Not applicable</p>	
<p>6. Exterior shutters are generally not acceptable. The addition of shutters is only acceptable if evidence exists that shutters were historically in use on the house. If so, replacement shutters shall replicate the original shutters.</p>	<p>Not applicable</p>	
<p>7. Awnings: If awnings are acceptable, the use of canvas or other woven materials is encouraged. Metal awnings are not appropriate. Awnings shall not hide important architectural features, nor obscure the shape of the window. Awning fixtures shall conform to the shape of the window opening.</p>	<p>Not applicable</p>	
<p>8. Security bars: The use of security bars is discouraged. Property owners are urged to contact LUCC Staff for advice on how to increase security with minimal impact to the historic character of a building.</p>	<p>Not applicable</p>	

<p>9. Vents Vents shall be retained wherever possible. When it is demonstrated to be necessary to convert a vent to a window, the exterior shape and moldings are to be maintained. Complete removal of vents from the façade is not appropriate.</p>	<p>Not applicable</p>	
<p>D. Doors: New door panels, if approved, shall be consistent in style and materials. New storm or screen doors visible from any street shall be simple in style and constructed of wood or material with a similar appearance to wood. New door openings, if approved, shall not be placed on the front façade or publicly visible side of the building, and shall be consistent with the original rhythm of the building's existing door opening.</p>	<p>There is physical evidence indicating the previous existence of a second door on the porch. The new door panel would be selected to match the existing front door.</p>	<p>YES</p>
<p>E. Porches: Porches were originally designed as outdoor spaces. Opening up previously enclosed porches is encouraged. The original lines of the porch roof and all original materials and decorative elements shall be retained whenever possible. Enclosing porches is discouraged. If a porch must be enclosed, transparent materials (glass or screen) that preserve the shape of the openings shall be used. The addition of opaque walls or materials is not appropriate. If a porch is to be enclosed with screen wire and requires a door, the new porch screen door shall be simple and constructed of wood or metal.</p>	<p>The proposal is to re-open a front porch that has been enclosed. No changes to the roof are proposed and all extant original materials and structural elements will be retained.</p> <p>The new wood columns and railing are features being introduced with the proposal. There is no historic or photographic evidence of the porch's original appearance. The proposed columns and railing are of simple design to compliment the house and not necessarily an attempt to imitate a historic feature.</p>	<p>YES</p>
<p>F. Roof Shapes and Materials:</p>		
<p>1. Retain the original style, pitch, and proportion of the roof. If these have been altered, rehabilitation shall be based on historical physical or pictorial documentation.</p>	<p>Not applicable</p>	
<p>2. Original parapet height and design shall be maintained.</p>	<p>Not applicable</p>	
<p>3. Pitched roof materials shall be replaced with material that is identical in appearance. Replacement shall be visually consistent in composition, size, shape, color, and texture to the original</p>	<p>Not applicable</p>	

or historically appropriate roofing material		
4 Skylights may be approved as appropriate if located at the rear of the house and not visible from the street.	Not applicable	
G. Architectural Features		
1. Retain and repair all architectural features rather than demolish. This includes the form, materials, or details. If this is not possible, replace with forms or details that are identical (or as close to identical as possible) to the original in size, shape and material.	All extant original materials and structural elements will be retained as feasible. Where material is introduced such as the wood shingles, they will be to match existing.	YES
2. Preserve significant unusual and unique forms and features wherever possible.	Not applicable	
3. Proposed new features shall be outside of the view from the public right of way wherever possible.	Not applicable	
H. Additions to Contributing Buildings	Not applicable	
II. Design Guidelines for Non-Contributing Buildings	Not applicable	
III. Design Guidelines for New Construction	Not applicable	
IV. Parking for Multi-Family or Commercial structures	Not applicable	
V. Mechanical and Ground Level Equipment	Not applicable	
VI. Miscellaneous Features	Not applicable	

Additional Considerations

The Downtown Neighborhood Association was notified of the request. They supplied a notice of support for the project as proposed.

Conclusions

There is substantial physical evidence that an open front porch once detailed the front façade of this 1910 hipped box. Based upon exploratory work at the rear of the house, it also appears that the original wood shingles are extant under the stucco siding.

The proposal to re-open a front porch is one that supports the house’s historic and architectural character. All original materials including ceiling, porch floor and windows will be retained.

Without pictorial evidence of the original appearance of the porch, the proposed columns and railing are of simple detail and can be considered an appropriate choice. They are not intended to provide a false sense of history but to compatible in character with the existing house.

***FINDINGS for a request for a Certificate of Appropriateness for - Case #09-LUCC-50026/
Project #1007906 (August 12, 2009)***

1. This application is a request for a Certificate of Appropriateness for alteration of a Contributing building at 516 11th St. NW, described as Lots 3 and 4, Block 6 of the Perea Addition, in the Fourth Ward Historic Overlay Zone, zoned SU-2/SF.
2. The subject property is a one and one-half story hipped box house, built ca. 1910 and designated as contributing property in the Fourth Ward Historic District.
3. The proposal is to remove infill material to expose the original front porch feature. The proposal is to use existing structural posts that are currently enclosed by a stucco finished wall. A new wall will be constructed to replace the original house wall on the south side of the porch, which was removed with a previous remodeling. The existing 16 over 1 wood sash windows will be relocated to the original front façade. An enclosed door opening will be re-opened and a new entry door installed to match existing. New wood columns and railing will complete the design of the proposed porch.
4. The work that is described above is consistent with applicable provisions of the Development Guidelines for Contributing buildings for the Fourth Ward Historic Overlay Zone. Applicable sections 1.A through 1.G are satisfied as analyzed in the staff report
5. Alterations to the property are subject to the provisions of LUC Ordinance.
6. The LUC Ordinance specifies that an application for a Certificate of Appropriateness shall be approved if it complies with several specified criteria. The work that is described above is consistent with relevant provisions in the LUC Ordinance Section 14-12-8-B- 1, 2, 4 and 6 as analyzed in the staff report.
7. The proposal is consistent with R-046-1991.
8. This proposal furthers the Comprehensive Plan goals and policies for historic resources that include to "protect, reuse or enhance significant historic buildings and districts."

RECOMMENDATION - Case No. 09-LUCC-50026/ Project # 1007906 – (August 12, 2009)

APPROVAL of 09-LUCC-50026/ Project # 1007906, an application for a Certificate of Appropriateness for alteration to the building at 516 11th St. NW. This property is more specifically described as Lot 3 & 4, Block 6, Perea Addition, a Contributing property in the Fourth Ward Historic Overlay Zone, zoned SU-2/SF, based on the above 8 Findings and subject to the following Conditions:

Conditions of Approval Recommended for Case No. 09-LUCC-50026/ Project # 1007906 – (August 12, 2009)

1. The applicant is to comply with all other relevant City of Albuquerque permits, policies and procedures.
-

**Maryellen Hennessy
Senior Planner, Development Review Division**

Attachments

CITY OF ALBUQUERQUE AGENCY COMMENTS

ZONING CODE SERVICES DIVISION

NO RESPONSE

BUILDING & SAFETY SERVICES DIVISION

APPROVED. Permit submittal required.

HISTORIC PRESERVATION/ADVANCED PLANNING

NO RESPONSE

PNM

ENVIRONMENTAL HEALTH DEPARTMENT

SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT DEPARTMENT

FIRE DEPARTMENT/Planning

COMMENTS FROM OTHER AGENCIES, WHEN APPLICABLE:

TRANSIT DEPARTMENT

POLICE DEPARTMENT

PARKS AND GENERAL SERVICES

OPEN SPACE DIVISION

BERNALILLO COUNTY

ALBUQUERQUE FLOOD CONTROL AUTHORITY

ALBUQUERQUE PUBLIC SCHOOLS

MIDDLE RIO GRANDE COUNCIL OF GOVERNMENTS